The Mennonite Quarterly Review

VOLUME XVIII OCTOBER, 1944 NUMBER FOUR

CONTENTS

EDITORIAL 194

THE HISTORIOGRAPHY OF THE MENNONITES IN THE NETHERLANDS 195

Cornelius Krahn

EXTINCT MENNONITE CHURCHES IN OHIO 225

III. THE CHURCH IN SENECA COUNTY (*Concluded*)

IV. THE CHURCH IN CRAWFORD AND RICHLAND COUNTIES

John Umble

BOOK REVIEWS: 251

Lee Emerson Deets, *The Hutterites: A Study in Social Cohesion.* Reviewed by J. Winfield Fretz

A. Warkentin and Melvin Gingerich, *Who's Who Among the Mennonites.* Reviewed by Paul Erb

James B. Hedges, *Building the Canadian West.* Reviewed by J. Winfield Fretz

EDITORIAL

THE LATE THOUGH VIGOROUS DEVELOPMENT OF THE STUDY OF THE HISTORY of the Swiss and South German Anabaptists may lead some students to overlook the fact that the study of the history of the Dutch Mennonites has run a radically different course. The actual facts are that Dutch Mennonite historiography began very early, that it came to full development two hundred years ago, and that its golden age was virtually completed before the thoroughgoing study of the Swiss movement had fairly begun. Another interesting contrast relates to the denominational connection of the historians of the two movements. Throughout its course Dutch historiography was largely the work of scholars from within the Mennonite ranks, and seldom was any significant work on the Dutch Mennonites produced by others. The opposite is true in the case of the Swiss, for it was non-Mennonite writers who pioneered in the study of Swiss-South German Anabaptist history, and seldom did a member of the Mennonite church produce outstanding work. Recently this has changed, with splendid work being done in both South Germany and the United States, but the quantity of this work is still small. For the Swiss historiography one thinks of "outside" names like Cornelius, Keller, Loserth, Bossert, Rembert; there are no corresponding non-Mennonite names among the writers on Dutch Mennonite history. Recently, it is true, the situation has changed, with the large majority of workers in Swiss Anabaptist history coming from Mennonite ranks directly. The quantity of production in Swiss historiography is however still far below that of Dutch Mennonite historiography with its two hundred years of productivity.

The wealth and diversity of the product of Dutch Mennonite historiography is strikingly displayed in this issue of the REVIEW under the title "The Historiography of the Mennonites in the Netherlands." Without professing to be exhaustive, the treatment is nevertheless quite thorough and valuable. Dr. Krahn is eminently qualified for the task, having studied for a year in the University of Amsterdam under Professor Kühler, the outstanding Dutch Mennonite historian of the present generation, and being thoroughly familiar with the Dutch language and the great Mennonite library in Amsterdam. He is preparing the Dutch-North German-Russian section of the comprehensive Anabaptist-Mennonite bibliography to be published by the Mennonite Historical Society, for which Robert Friedmann will prepare the Swiss-South German-Hutteran section, and Harold S. Bender the American section.

THIS ISSUE OF THE REVIEW CONTINUES THE SERIES OF STUDIES OF EXTINCT Ohio Mennonite congregations by John Umble, with the second half of Part III (Seneca County) and Part IV on Crawford and Richland Counties Professor Umble now completes what has often been a difficult and almost thankless task but one performed with the warm interest and painstaking devotion of the true scholar determined to glean the last bit of historical material out of what may seem to others to be a narrow field. A review of what he has published brings one to the vivid realization of the tragedy of lost opportunity and lost men and women in the pioneer days of the westward-moving Mennonitism a century ago. Better leadership in colonization and congregation building would have made the writing of such a series unnecessary and impossible for it would have meant the establishment of vigorous, productive Mennonite communities in many places. We may hope that the lessons of the past will not be lost on the present generation. In a later issue Professor Umble will tell the story of an early Ohio community in Ashland County with its conflict between older and newer immigrant groups.

The Mennonite Quarterly Review

Vol. XVIII No. 4

THE HISTORIOGRAPHY OF THE MENNONITES IN THE NETHERLANDS *

CORNELIUS KRAHN

Introductory Statement

This study is not intended to give a complete bibliography of contributions by or on Dutch Mennonites. The writer plans to do this in a later study. This article is limited to giving an outline of the historiography of the Dutch Mennonites and to tracing the trends of the development in this field. The main writers and their works will be mentioned.

Since the Mennonites of the Lower Rhine (Crefeld, etc.) and Lower Elbe (Hamburg, Emden, etc.) until recent times formed an organic unity with those of The Netherlands, they will be included. Literature of the Anabaptism of Münster will be mentioned but briefly since it is generally known and accessible. Emphasis will be placed on Dutch literature by Mennonite writers.

In his article, *The Historiography of the German Reformation During the Last Twenty Years,* Wilhelm Pauck has pointed out

* A slightly enlarged and revised reprint of the article by the same name which appeared in the September, 1944, issue of *Church History.* A number of the editors of the *MQR* contributed suggestions for the revision. Reprints of the original article may be obtained from the Bethel College Bookstore, North Newton, Kansas, at fifty cents per copy.—C. K.

that a rapid increase in research in the field of *Anabaptistica* of late is due to the need of filling out the picture of the beginning of Protestantism and to the fact that modern descendants of sectarians have begun to make scholarly contributions to their history.[1] The writer is in full agreement with this statement but would like to add that the Mennonites of The Netherlands have been making more or less scholarly contributions to the history of Anabaptism for about two centuries. Since H. Schyn wrote his *Historia Christianorum. . .* (1723), a steady increase of research in Holland can be observed.

Let us briefly consider two questions. First, how do we account for the fact that the Mennonites of The Netherlands made scholarly contributions concerning their history long before their co-religionists in other countries? Secondly, why is this wealth of literature so little known among scholars abroad? May we attempt to answer the latter question first. Most of the literature on Dutch Anabaptism by Dutch writers is written in the language of a comparatively small country. Therefore few American scholars could undertake the task of acquainting themselves with this literature.[2]

The first question requires a more detailed answer. Although the founders of the Anabaptists in Switzerland were university trained, they produced little significant literature, since most of them were exterminated after a few years by the cruel persecution of their age. Thus Anabaptism of southern Europe became a faith of the lower classes and the peasantry. Since that time Anabaptism has largely been limited to rural people living in isolation from the "world." The Low Countries, however, are an exception. Here Anabaptism began predominantly as a movement among the lower classes of the cities. In The Netherlands the Mennonites shunned the "world" more consistently and extremely than anywhere else, but being mainly urban and sharing, as time went on, the wealth and opportunities of the Golden Age of the country, the more progressive factions of Dutch Mennonitism gradually became secularized. They began to take part in all functions of the social, cultural, economic, and political life of the country. Soon we find among them men like the great writer, Joost van den Vondel, the poet and painter, Carel van Mander, the painter Rembrandt, and others.

[1] *Church History* IX, (1940), 336.

[2] Among them we would like to mention H. E. Dosker's studies on Dutch Anabaptism, A. H. Newman's *History of Anti-Pedobaptism*, Roland H. Bainton's biography of David Joris, and the studies on European Anabaptism (including The Netherlands) by C. Henry Smith and the late John Horsch.

It is not surprising that in such an atmosphere scholarly inquiry into the beginnings of their own history could grow and develop.

Let us now outline the different periods in the development of Dutch Mennonite historiography. When a movement originates in struggle and persecution there is little time for retrospection and objective description of facts. This was especially true in the case of the Dutch Anabaptists, who for a long time were persecuted, gradually tolerated, and finally granted freedom. The early literature relating to them, as was the case during the first centuries of the Christian Church, was produced by both friend and foe. Controversy is the characteristic of all historic literature of this period. And Anabaptism did not struggle only with the foe outside of the flock but also within its brotherhood. The attempt to establish a church "without spot or wrinkle" caused the internal controversy. Accordingly, before we enter the field of modern historiography, we wish to notice the high points of this controversial literature as far as it has value for the historian of Mennonitism.

I. Controversial Historical Literature (1530-1740)

1. *The Period of External Controversy*

Soon after the seed of Anabaptism had been sown in the Low Countries by Melchior Hofmann (1531), the controversy in this matter began. It found its most potent source in the catastrophe of Anabaptism in Münster (1535). For centuries this tragic episode overshadowed all reports and even serious research in the field of *Anabaptistica.* On the other hand the peaceful Mennonites attempted to prove that there was no connection between them and the revolutionary Anabaptists.

Before Menno Simons withdrew from the Catholic Church and became the leader of the Dutch Anabaptists he wrote "a very clear and explicit" pamphlet against Jan van Leiden, the king of the New Jerusalem (1535).[3] But Menno Simons was involved in religious discussions with more worthy opponents than Jan van Leiden. John à Lasco, reformer of East Frisia, had a religious debate with Menno Simons in Emden in 1544, after which Menno handed him his confession of faith.[4] A Lasco replied to this.[5]

[3] Menno Simons, *Opera omnia theologica* (Amsterdam, 1681), 619-631; or *Complete Works of Menno Simons* (Elkhart, 1871), II, 424-440.
[4] *Opera omnia,* 517-542; *Complete Works* II, 325-350.
[5] J. à Lasco, *Opera,* ed. A. Kuyper (1866), I, 1-60.

Gellius Faber, who had participated in the above-mentioned debate, wrote a pamphlet against the Anabaptists in which he denied the proper calling of the Anabaptist ministers.[6] In answering this challenge Menno gives the most detailed and valuable information concerning his development as a priest and consequent conversion to Anabaptism.[7]

An early and outstanding Catholic opponent of Menno Simons and the Anabaptists was M. Duncanus.[8] The strongest attack by a representative of the Reformed Church of this time was made by Guido de Brès.[9] The great reformed theologian Dathenus was not only the chief opponent of the Anabaptists at the Frankenthal Debate (1571) but also a writer against them.[10] G. Nicolai translated H. Bullinger's *Adversus anabaptistas* and added a refutation of Dutch Anabaptism (1569).[11] There is a complete account of a religious debate held at Emden (1578) between representatives of the Reformed Church and the Mennonites lasting 124 sessions.[12] A similar debate consisting of 156 sessions was held at Leeuwarden in 1593.[13] Peter van Keulen was the outstanding representative of the Mennonites at both places.

J. P. van der Meulen wrote the *Successio Apostolica* (1600) to prove that the Anabaptist Church was in direct lineal descent from the Apostolic Church. A Catholic priest (Simon Walraven) answered this in the well known *Successio Anabaptistica* (1603). The latter proved to be an important source for Mennonite history, and was reprinted by S. Cramer (*BRN*, VII). H. Faukelius, a

[6] Gellius Faber, *Eine antwert . . . vp einen bitterhönischen bereff der Wedderdöper* (Madgeburg, 1552).

[7] *Een klare beantwoordinge over een schrift Gellii Fabri, Opera,* 225-324; *Complete Works,* II, 1-105.

[8] *Anabaptisticae haeresos confutatio et vere Christiani baptismi ac potissimum paedobaptismatis assertio, adversus M. Simonis Frisii virulentas de baptismo blasphemias* (1549).

[9] *La racine, source et fondement des anabaptistes ou rebaptisez de nostre temps* (1565). A number of reprints of a Dutch translation appeared. See Kühler, *Geschiedenis der Nederlandsche Doopsgezinden in de Zestiende Eeuw* (Haarlem, 1923), 440. An English translation was published at Cambridge (Mass.) in 1668.

[10] S. Blaupot ten Cate, *Geschiedenis der Doopsgezinden in Holland, Zeeland Utrecht en Gelderland* (Amsterdam, 1847), II, 215-16.

[11] *Inlasschingen in het vertaalde werk v. Bullinger: "Teghens de Wederdoopers,"* (Emden, 1569). Reprinted in *Bibliotheca Reformatoria Neerlandica,* VII.

[12] Kühler, *Geschiedenis,* 447 ff.

[13] *Ibid.*

Reformed minister, wrote *Babel, d. i. Verwerringhe der Wederdooperen onder malkanderen* (1621), in which he attempted to produce evidence of the weakness and heresy of Anabaptism because of its numerous divisions. This was answered by A. Roscius, among others, in *Babel, d. i. Verwerringe der Kinderdooperen onder malcanderen* (1626). He pointed out that, on the same grounds, the believers in infant baptism must be guilty of greater heresy since there were more divisions among them than among the Anabaptists. J. Cloppenburch was another minister who wrote against the Anabaptists.[14] A well-known source on Anabaptism is *Grouwelen der vornaemster Hooft-Ketteren . . .* (Leyden, 1607), originally published in Dutch and translated into German and Latin (1608), and English (1655).[15] J. Hoornbeek, a Reformed theologian, wrote numerous books concerning the Anabaptists, among which *Summae controversarium religionis* (1658) is outstanding. His colleague, F. F. Spanheim, also participated in this controversy.[16] His book, *Selectarum de religione controversiarum elenchus* (1687), was answered by the Mennonite minister, Engel Arendszoon van Dooregeest, in *Brief aan den Heer F. Spanhemius Prof. der H. Godsgeleertheyt en der Historien tot Leyden* (Amsterdam, 1693).[17] Another outstanding defender of the Mennonite cause was the well-known physician and minister of the Mennonite Church at Amsterdam, Galenus Abrahamsz de Haan, in his *Verdediging der Christenen die Doopsgezinde genaamd worden, beneffens korte grondstellingen van hun gelove en leere* (Amsterdam, 1699). G. Roosen, pastor of the Mennonite Church at Altona (Elbe), wrote *Unschuld u. Gegen-Bericht der Evangel. Tauffgesinnten Christen, so Mennonisten genandt werden . . .* (Ratzeburg, 1702). Among the many books of devotional, controversial, and historical character written by Pieter Jansz Twisck we mention in this connection his *Chroniick van den Ondergangh der Tyrannen* (2 vols., 1604 and 1628).[18]

About the middle of the eighteenth century a revival of the controversy occurred, for the Mennonites were accused by their Reformed neighbors of harboring Socinian beliefs. This accusation

[14] *Gangraena Theologiae Anabaptisticae* (Franekerae, 1645).

[15] *Catalogus*, 7.

[16] S. Blaupot ten Cate, *Geschiedenis*, II, 222-223.

[17] J. Loosjes, art. "Dooregeest," *Mennonitisches Lexikon*, I, 466.

[18] For other writings in this connection by the same author see *Catalogus*, 198-199.

centered mainly around the gifted Mennonite minister, J. Stinstra.[19] A case similar to Stinstra's was that of A. van der Os.[20] W. J. Dowen in his *Socinianen en Doopsgezinden* (Leiden, 1898), W. J. Kühler in *Het Socinianisme in Nederland* (Leiden, 1912), and J. C. van Slee in *De Geschiedenis van het Socinianisme in de Nederlanden,*[21] give a detailed account of this controversy.[22]

The article, "De Nederlandsche Gereformeerde Synoden tegenover de Doopsgezinden (1563-1620)" by F. S. Knipscheer,[23] discusses the relationship of the Reformed Synods to the Mennonites. The proceedings of the Reformed Synods were published by Reitsma and van Veen in *Acta der Provinciale en Particuliere Synoden* (I-VII, 1892-1898).

2. *Devotional Literature and Internal Controversy*

The sixteenth century brought to a climax the attempt of the Mennonites to establish a church "without spot or wrinkle" after the apostolic model. This finds its reflection far into the seventeenth century in devotional and historical literature. Throughout this period the ideal of the Mennonites was a quiet and peaceful life in seclusion from the world. But the Dutch Golden Age of the seventeenth century lured many of them out of their isolation. Since they were largely an urban people, this was a comparatively rapid process. Whatever the names of the persons and movements which waxed and waned into the eighteenth century, it was usually a struggle between the adherents of the sixteenth century "mennist" concept of a pure Christian Church with the enforcement of rigid church discipline, and the broader concept of the more liberal and tolerant factions. Names, persons, and ideas changed in this struggle, but the trend remained the same until the modern and progressive spirit of the "Doopsgezinde" became predominant and the conservative "mennist" spirit gradually disappeared.[24] This modern

[19] Chr. Sepp wrote *Johannes Stinstra en zijn tijd* (2 vols., Amsterdam, 1865-66).

[20] See *Catalogus,* 140-146.

[21] *Teylers Godgeleerd Genootschap,* N. S. XVIII (Haarlem, 1914).

[22] For further literature on this controversy see *Catalogus,* 109-146.

[23] *Doopsgezinde Bijdragen* (Leiden, 1910 and 1911).

[24] On the origin and significance of the terms "Mennonite" and "Doopsgezinde" see S. Müller in *Jaarboekje voor de Doopsgezinde Gemeenten in de Nederlanden,* 1837, 30-50. "Doopsgezinde" literally means "baptism minded" people. This is the official name of the Mennonites of the Netherlands. After the above mentioned develop-

and tolerant attitude of the "Doopsgezinde" developed in opposition not only to rigid earlier Mennonitism but also to the intolerant and harsh Dutch Calvinism. In other words, the liberal "Doopsgezinde," along with the Remonstrants and other Dutch liberals, became a significant factor in forming a cultural left wing in a predominantly orthodox Calvinistic country. To a large extent this accounts for the fact that the Mennonites of The Netherlands differ in certain respects from those of other countries.

After this introduction it will be clear that historical source material can be expected in both devotional and controversial literature. Furthermore, in some instances it is hard to distinguish between the two types, since a given book may have both purposes.

A number of books by Menno Simons and Dirk Philips deal with matters of internal controversy. Outstanding are questions of church discipline, that is, excommunication and shunning.[25] A valuable objective account of the origin and the divisions among the early Anabaptists was written by Obbe Philips.[26] He was the one who had baptized Menno Simons and his own brother, Dirk Philips, but later withdrew from the brotherhood. A similarly significant source is *Het beginsel en voortganck der geschillen, scheuringen, en verdeeltheden* . . . (Amsterdam, 1658).[27]

The outstanding contribution which the Anabaptists of the sixteenth century made in the field of devotional and historical literature was the compilation and publication of *Het Offer des Heeren* (1562), the first edition of the famous collection of biographies, testimonies, and songs of Anabaptist martyrs.[28] The prominent writer and leader of the more liberal Mennonites (Waterlanders), Hans de Ries, enlarged this collection considerably and had it published in 1615 under the title *Historie der Martelaaren.* P. J. Twisck, a voluminous writer and representative of the more conservative Mennonites (Old Frisians), edited a reprint of this edition for his churches and added a confession of faith (1617). The resulting controversy brought forth a significant description of the inner

ment, "Doopsgezinde" implies a certain tolerant, individualistic type of piety in opposition to a narrow orthodoxy.

The German form "Taufgesinnte," sometimes used for the Mennonites of North Germany, does not carry this connotation.

25 Cornelius Krahn, *Menno Simons* (Karlsruhe, 1936), 88-96.

26 *Bekenntenisse* (Amsterdam, 1584). Reprinted in *BRN,* VII.

27 Reprinted in *BRN,* VII. Formerly ascribed to Carel van Ghent.

28 Reprinted in *BRN,* II.

conditions of the Mennonite Church during the latter part of the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries in Hans Alenson's *Tegen-Bericht op de voor-Reden van't groote Martelaer Boeck der Doops-Ghesinde* (1630).[29]

Better known is the enlarged edition of the *Martyr's Mirror* edited by Tielemann Jansz van Braght under the following title: *Het Bloedigh Tooneel der Doops-gezinde en Weereloose Christenen, die om het getuygenisse Jesus . . . geleden hebben en gedoodt zijn, v. Christi tijdt af, tot dese onse laetste tijden toe. Mitsgaders, een beschrijvinge des H. Doops e. a. stucken. Begrepen in twee boecken. Zijnde een vergrootinge v. den voorgaenden Martelaers-Spiegel* (Dordrecht, 1660).[30] Later editions were illustrated by the Mennonite artist and poet, Jan Luyken. T. J. van Braght's book is not merely a compilation of facts and biographies concerning the Anabaptist martyrs, as the previous edition had been, but an attempt to interpret history. In tracing the history of the martyrs from the Apostolic Church down to the Anabaptist persecution he concludes that the true Christian Church has always had its martyrs. He also includes a history of baptism in his book proving that adult baptism was practiced during the first centuries of the Christian Church and later replaced by infant baptism. *Nietigheydt van den Kinder-Doop* (Amsterdam, 1647, 261 pp.) by Hermanus Montanus, a Remonstrant, was an important and popular study which originally (1646) appeared in Latin and was reprinted several times in Dutch.

Until the middle of the seventeenth century the internal controversy in Holland centered mainly around questions of the degree of rigidness and strictness of church discipline and the attitude of the church toward the world. This divided the Mennonites into numerous factions such as Waterlanders, Frisians, Flemish, and others, which in turn were subdivided into various lesser branches.

[29] Reprinted in *BRN*, VII.

[30] For further literature on Anabaptist martyrology see *Mennonitisches Lexikon. Catalogus*, 14-16. W. J. Kühler, *Geschiedenis*, 245-277. W. J. Kühler, *Geschiedenis van de Doopsgezinden in Nederland* (Haarlem, 1940), II, 97-115. F. Pijper, "De Doopsgezinde Martelaarsboeken" in *Martelaarsboeken* (The Hague, 1924) 73-119. German editions appeared in 1748 (Ephrata, Pa.) and 1780 (Pirmasens) and three times later in the U.S.A. English editions appeared in 1837 (Lancaster, Pa.) and 1886 (Elkhart, Ind.) and later. See also footnote 38 on J. Mehrning, who is supposed to have influenced the Dutch Mennonite interpretation of its history. But it should be remembered that writers like Menno Simons, Dirk Philips, and others trace their church and mode of baptism back to the Apostolic Church and even further.

Then a great new upheaval overshadowed the former divisions and caused the formation of two main wings. This was caused by the rationalistic-pietistic movement of the Collegiants and the Socinians, mentioned above in connection with the discussion on the external controversy of the Mennonites.

A brilliant physician, Galenus Abrahamsz de Haan, minister of the Flemish Mennonite Church of Amsterdam, became the central figure of the Collegiant movement in The Netherlands. His chief opponent was his colleague, Samuel Apostool, also a physician and minister in the same church. The latter represented the conservative Mennonite groups, while the former, influenced by modern trends and thought of his time, advocated a liberal reformation of his church. Being an outstanding and influential leader he had a large following. The controversy resulted in a schism in the Amsterdam church in 1664 and gradually spread throughout the country. The followers of G. A. de Haan were known as "Lamists" and those of Apostool as "Zonists" from the names of their respective meetinghouses in Amsterdam. From the flood of pamphlets and writings which resulted from this controversy we select only a few typical titles. Theodore van der Meer wrote *Het Gekraay van een Sociniaanse Haan, onder Doopsgezinde Veederen* (1663).[31] An outstanding anonymous pamphlet was *Lammerenkrijgh* (1663).[32] See in this connection J. C. van Slee. *Rijnsburger Collegianten* (Haarlem 1895).

II. Beginnings of Historiography

During the first half of the eighteenth century the historiography of the Dutch Mennonites became more scholarly. It was, however, not the liberal wing that made the first contribution of this type. To be sure, they had founded a theological seminary at Amsterdam in 1735, but their main interest centered around current problems. Some of these problems dealt with the relationship of religion to natural science, philosophy, etc. The spirit of unlimited tolerance

31 "The Crow of a Socinian Rooster Decked with Mennonite Feathers."

32 "The War of the Lambs" has reference to the name "Lamists" and their principle of nonresistance. Similarly descriptive titles include *'t Gescheurde Schaapskleedt van Dr. Galenus Abrahamsz* (Leyden, 1663); *Schuit-praatje* (Amsterdam, 1664); *Straat-praatje;* see *Catalogus,* 109 ff. On G. A. de Haan see the excellent biographical article in *ML* (II. 28) by C. B. Hylkema.

and growing indifference which was spreading among them was not conducive to appreciation and study of their past. It is, therefore, evident that this progressive wing of the Mennonites could not at this time make any significant scholarly contributions in this field. At the threshold of modern historiography in The Netherlands we find representatives of the conservative "Zonists" like H. Schyn, Gerardus Maatschoen, and M. Schagen.[33]

The first book of H. Schyn, *Korte historie der protestante Christenen, die men Mennoniten of Doopsgezinden noemt, etc.* (Amsterdam, 1711), was written for the general public. Encouraged by the fact that scholars abroad made wide use of it, he wrote a Latin version of his book, [34] which was followed by a second volume.[35] M. van Maurik translated these two volumes into the Dutch (1727 and 1738). G. Maatschoen, like Schyn a minister and physician at Amsterdam, made another translation and added a preface, annotations, illustrations, and a third volume.[36] Although these men were not full-fledged historians in the modern sense of the term, they produced a significant work in compiling much valuable material. They viewed past and present controversial matters objectively and encouraged others to continue along these lines. A book of some importance of this period is Kornelius van Huyzen, *Historische verhandeling van de Opkomst en Voortgang, mitsgaders de God-Geleertheyd der Doopsgezinde Christenen* (Emden, 1712, Hoorn, 1734). Another ardent collector of *Anabaptistica* and the author of a book on the Waldenses was Marten Schagen, linguist, book dealer, and minister. He was the translator of F. S. Rues's *Aufrichtige Nachrichten von dem Gengenwärtigen Zustande der Mennoniten* . . . (Jena, 1843).[37] The extent of the libraries of the latter and G. Maatschoen, as revealed in the printed catalogs, indicates their extraordinary interest and knowledge in this new field of study.

Among the non-Mennonite writers we should mention Jakob

[33] S. Blaupot ten Cate, *Geschiedenis,* II, 141.

[34] *Historia Christianorum qui in Belgi Foeder. inter Protestantes Mennonitae appellantur* (Amsterdam, 1723).

[35] *Historiae Mennonitarum plenior deductio, etc.* (Amsterdam, 1729).

[36] *Geschiedenis dier Christenan, welke in de Vereenigde Nederlanden onder de Protestanten Mennoniten genaamd worden* (Amsterdam, 1743-45).

[37] *Tegenw. Staet der Doopsgezinden of Mennoniten, in de Vereen. Nederlanden* (Amsterdam, 1745).

Mehrning,[38] the Remonstrant historian Geeraert Brandt,[39] A. Moubach and B. Picard.[40]

The second half of the eighteenth century is marked by a general indifference and decline of the Dutch Mennonite church life. Both numerically and spiritually the group reached its lowest level at the end of the century. It is true that in 1778 the noted *Teyler's Godgeleerd Genootschap* of Haarlem was founded[41] and has contributed, especially of late, to the furtherance of research in the field of *Anabaptistica.* At that time, however, the relationship of religion to natural science and philosophy was, in accordance with the general spirit of the age, the main concern of the organization. Thus we see that Mennonite historiography received a set-back from which it did not recover before the beginning of the nineteenth century.

III. A Century of Historiography (1840-1940)

The beginning of the nineteenth century marks a new era in the history of Dutch Mennonitism. The most sincere and loyal among them realized the necessity of uniting the scattered churches and the divided forces of the small brotherhood. After a number of local unions had been formed, the *Algemeene Doopsgezinde Societeit (A.D.S.)* was organized in 1811. This organization included nearly all the Mennonite congregations of The Netherlands and the adjacent German Mennonite churches. The general and main purpose of this organization was to care for the spiritual and economic welfare of the churches and to prevent further decline. To accomplish this the newly established *A.D.S.* accepted the supervision of the Mennonite Theological Seminary at Amsterdam, which had previously been sponsored by the local church, and gave financial support to small churches which could not provide for themselves.

38 *S. Baptismi Historia: Das ist / Heilige Tauff-Historia / In welcher die Wahrheit der Ersten-Ein-und-Eygentlichen Tauffordnung Jesu Christi, aus heiliger Schrifft deutlich widerholt / darzu aus vielen Alten und Newen / Kirchenhistorien durch alle Hundert Jährige Zeiten von Anfang der Tauff biszhieher bezeuget / Und wie solche fast nach allen Hauptstücken / offt verändert / und in schädliche Miszbräuch verkehret sey worden* (Dortmundt, 1646-47).

39 *Historie der Reformatie* (4 volumes, *Amsterdam,* 1671-1704).

40 *Naaukeurige Beschryving der uitwendige Godstdienst-plichten* (6 volumes, Amsterdam, 1727-1738).

41 Pieter Teyler van der Hulst, a Mennonite of Haarlem, was instrumental in founding this organization through a bequest.

The revived church life as well as the newly established church unions aroused historical interest. From this time forward the Mennonite Theological Seminary of Amsterdam remained the center of Mennonite historical research. Efficient professors and librarians collected and preserved, in the library and archives of the Mennonite Church of Amsterdam, what is now known as the best collection of *Anabaptistica.*

The first of the professors to pioneer in this field was Samuel Muller. He introduced a course in Mennonite history at the seminary and founded and edited the *Jaarboekje voor de Doopsgezinde gemeenten in de Nederlanden* (1837-1850). In addition, he wrote numerous articles and collected much material.[42] Furthermore, he inspired his students of theology to continue his work. Two other men deserve mention for their work as pioneers at this time. A. M. Cramer, father of Samuel Cramer, wrote the first comprehensive biography of Menno Simons.[43] S. Blaupot ten Cate was the author of an extensive and scholarly history of the Mennonites of The Netherlands which is indispensable even today.

1. *The Origin of Anabaptism*

The relationship between the Münsterite Anabaptists and Dutch Mennonitism had always been a sensitive subject for the earlier Mennonite writers. From the time of the writings of Menno Simons against Jan van Leyden and Menno's *Fundamentboek*[45] until the history of the Mennonites was written by Schyn-Maatschoen, the main object was that of defense. The opponents emphasized the similarities which pointed to a common origin with the fanatic elements in Anabaptism, while the Mennonite writers denied or minimized this and attempted to prove the Biblical character of their church which they traced back, hypothetically, to the

[42] See Chr. Sepp, *Bibliothek van Nederlandsche Kerkgeschiedschrijvers* (Leiden, 1886) 386-87; *ML,* III, 180-91; *Catalogus,* 300.

[43] *Het leven en de verrigtingen van Menno Simons* (Amsterdam, 1837).

[44] *Geschiedenis der Doopsgezinden in Friesland* (Leeuwarden, 1839); *Geschiedenis der Doopsgezinden in Groningen, Overijssel en Oost-Friesland* (Leeuwarden, 1842), two volumes in one; *Geschiedenis der Doopsgezinden in Holland, Zeeland, Utrecht en Gelderland* (Amsterdam, 1847), two volumes in one.

J. G. de Hoop Scheffer, professor and librarian at Amsterdam, was editor of the *Doopsgezinde Bijdragen* and a pioneer historian. Christiaan Sepp also carried on extensive research in the field of *Anabaptistica.* In addition to the book mentioned in note 42, he wrote *Geschiedkundige Nasporingen* (3 vols., Leyden, 1872-75), etc.

[45] Cornelius Krahn, "Menno Simons' Fundament-boek," *MQR,* October, 1939.

Apostolic Church. The interpretation of the history of the Mennonites by T. J. van Braght in the *Martyr's Mirror* has been mentioned before. In this *Successio Apostolica*[46] theory the Waldenses furnished a welcome link. Outstanding among those who did research in the history of the Waldenses and their supposed connection with the Anabaptists was A. M .Cramer in his above-mentioned book on Menno Simons (1837). He, as well as S. Blaupot ten Cate, did not find any definite evidence of a direct lineage from the Waldenses to the Anabaptists. I. H. Halbertsma based his theory of this historical connection on the similarities between the Waldenses and the Anabaptists.[47] This proved to be a challenge for further research in that field. Blaupot ten Cate wrote *Geschiedkundig onderzoek naar den Waldensischen oorsprong van de Nederlandsche Doopsgezinde* (Amsterdam, 1844), while others made contributions of lesser importance to this field.[48] However, even after the Dutch Mennonite historians had given up this theory, a staunch advocate of it arose in the German historian and archivist, Ludwig Keller. In his numerous writings, he advocated the theory of the direct descent of the Anabaptists from what he called the pre-Reformation Old-Evangelical Brethren Churches. In this chain of Evangelical Churches, the Waldenses formed an important link.[49]

Returning to the relationship of the Münsterite Anabaptists to the Dutch Mennonites, it should be stated that it was the research of the Catholic scholar, C. A. Cornelius, which changed the approach to the problem radically.[50] From that time both Catholic and Protestant scholars gradually gave increasingly unprejudiced consideration to the Anabaptist movement of the sixteenth century. Especially the following historians and sociologists are to be mentioned in this connection: L. Keller, K. Müller, E. Troeltsch, A. Harnack, and W. Köhler. They are chiefly responsible for the fact that the Anabaptists are no longer considered the *Stiefkinderen van het Christendom,*[51] but legitimate offspring of the Reformation.

[46] This is the title of the above-mentioned book by J. P. van der Meulen.

[47] *De Doopsgezinden en hunne herkomst* (Deventer, 1843).

[48] See also Blaupot ten Cate, *Geschiedenis der Doopsgezinden in Holland,* 365-81.

[49] *Die Reformation und die älteren Reformparteien* (1866), and other publications.

[50] See H. Cornelius, art. "Cornelius, C. A.," *ML,* I, 372-374; Hege, art. "Geschichtschreibung, II, 98. Outstanding among his writings are *Berichte der Augenzeugen über das Münsterische Wiedertäuferreich* (Münster, 1853); *Geschichte der Münsterischen Aufruhrs* (2 vols., Leipzig, 1855-1860).

[51] A book by J. Lindeboom ('S Gravenhage, 1929).

The manner in which the assertion of a connection between the Mennonites and the Münsterite Anabaptists was revived in our own century is an irony of history. This time it was not a debate between an "orthodox" Catholic or Protestant and a "heretic" Anabaptist, but a lively and lengthy disussion between the two leading Dutch Mennonite historians of this time. It was a controversy between K. Vos, minister and historian, and W. Kühler, professor of the Mennonite Theological Seminary and the University at Amsterdam (See Krahn, art "Kühler," *M.L.* II, 582.)

In 1917 Vos published (in *DB*) *Kleine bijdragen over de Doopersche beweging in Nederland tot het optreden van Menno Simons.* Influenced by the materialistic and socialistic interpretation of the Münster incident, Vos does not hesitate to consider the chiliastic and revolutionary element of Anabaptism, as it found its most extreme expression in the Kingdom of Münster, a genuine original Dutch Anabaptism. According to this interpretation, the biblicist peaceful element become dominant after the Münster catastrophe through falling from one extreme to another. Kühler replied to this in his article *Het Nederlandsche Anabaptisme en de revolutionnaire woelingen der zestiende eeuw* (*DB*, 1919). This in turn was answered by Vos in *Revolutionnaire Hervorming (De Gids,* LXXXIV, 1920*)*. Kühler concluded the controversy with his *Het Anabaptisme in Nederland (De Gids,* 1921). In his article, as well as in his subsequently published history of the Mennonites in The Netherlands, Kühler emphasizes that the biblicist peaceful type of Anabaptism, without the practicing of adult baptism, existed in The Netherlands before the preaching and baptizing of M. Hofmann in 1531 (in the Sacramentist movement, the Brethren of the Common Life, etc.). Hofmann and his preachers were reaping without sowing. After Hofmann had been taken captive, the Anabaptist movement split into two groups: the left wing of Münster, and the right wing of Obbe and Dirk Philips, Menno Simons, and others. No doubt Kühler came closer to the historical truth than Vos, even though he probably over-emphasized the independence of the reformatory movement in The Netherlands from non-Dutch sources.

2. *General and Local History*

In addition to the above-mentioned histories on the origin of the Dutch Anabaptists some earlier and some recent monographs

and studies of a general character deserve mention. The Mennonite historians of the nineteenth century, S. Müller, de Hoop Scheffer, S. Cramer, and others furnished a number of articles on the Mennonites, Menno Simons, etc., for the internationally known encyclopedias of different countries. De Hoop Scheffer's article, "Korte geschiedenis der Mennoniten en Doopsgezinden" (*DB,* 1882), translated from the second edition of the *Real-Encyclopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche,*[52] and S. Cramer's article, "Mennoniten," in the third edition of this work, deserve special mention. The latter also wrote, among other contributions, a significant study on "De Doopsgezinde Broederschap in de negentiende eeuw" (*DB,* 1901) and a survey of Dutch Mennonite statistics of the nineteenth century (*DB,* 1902). Some of the many contributions of general and local nature by Christiaan Sepp have been mentioned previously.

The most significant history of the Mennonites of The Netherlands, after the afore-mentioned one by S. Blaupot ten Cate, was that of Anna Brons, *Ursprung, Entwicklung und Schicksale der altevangelischen Taufgesinnten oder Mennoniten in kurzen Zügen übersichtlich dargestellt* (Norden, 1884), which covers the history of Mennonites in all countries.[53]

The urgently felt need for a scholarly Dutch history of the Mennonites of The Netherlands grew stronger and stronger. At present this is being answered by the formerly mentioned W. Kühler, professor in the Amsterdam Seminary. In 1932 he published *Geschiedenis der Nederlandsche Doopsgezinden in de zestiende eeuw* (Haarlem), which was continued in 1940 when the first half of the second volume appeared, now entitled *Geschiedenis van de Doopsgezinden in Nederland* (Tweede deel, 1600-1735, eerste helft). Kühler's history is written in a splendid style and with a perfect mastery of the Dutch sources. However, in interpreting the great changes that have taken place in Dutch Mennonitism and distributing light and shadow between the conservative "Mennonites" and the progressive "Doopsgezinden" he is not entirely impartial. It is this weakness that the American Mennonite historian, John Horsch, attacks.[54] In many instances his criticism may be justified,

[52] He wrote also *Broederschap der Doopsgezinden.* For additional literature see Chr. Sepp, *Bibliotheek,* 387-389.

[53] The third edition, revised by E. M. ten Cate, was published in Amsterdam, 1912.

[54] "Is Dr. Kühler's Conception of Early Dutch Anabaptism Historically Sound?" *Mennonite Quarterly Review,* VII (1933), 48-64, 97-126.

but in general he shows a similar inclination in the opposite extreme. Horsch writes from the more conservative American Mennonite point of view and Kühler from that of the modern *Doopsgezinde.* Thus it is not surprising that the interpretations of the two historians sometimes differ as widely as their geographic distance.

A general survey of early Anabaptism, including the Dutch, was written in Scotland by R. J. Smithson entitled *The Anabaptists, Their Contributions to our Protestant Heritage,* (London 1935). Robert Barclay, *The Inner Life of the Religious Societies of the Commonwealth* (London, 1876) and A. H. Newman, *A History of Anti-Pedobaptism. . . to 1609* (Philadelphia, 1897) contain valuable chapters on Dutch Anabaptism.

Valuable reports on various phases of Dutch Mennonitism were given at the Mennonite World Conference of Danzig and Amsterdam.[55] Among the publications regarding local churches and provinces the following should be mentioned. The *Mennonitisches Lexikon* has, for instance, excellent articles on the Mennonite congregation and the Mennonite Theological Seminary of Amsterdam by J. ten Doornkaat Koolman. (I, 58-68). This estimable source which has thus far been completed to the letter "Q," also contains histories of other small and large churches. For further literature one should consult the *Catalogus* of the Mennonite Library of Amsterdam (146-155, 287-297). Two useful works on the Anabaptists in Amsterdam have been published by Greta Grosheide: *Bijdrage tot de geschiedenis der Anabaptisten in Amsterdam* (Academisch proefschrift Amsterdam, Hilversum, J. Schipper, Jr., 1938) and *Verhooren En Vonnissen der Wederdoopers, Betrokken bij de Aanslagen op Amsterdam* (*Bijdragen en Mededeelingen van het Historisch Genootschap,* 41 te Deel, 1-197, Amsterdam, 1920). In the same *Bijdragen* of 1920 appeared two important source reports by Dr. A. Hulshof: *Extracten uit de Rekeningen van het Schoutambacht van Haarlem Betreffende Wederdoopers* (1535-1538) *and Alphabetisch Register op de Verhooren der Wederdoopers te Amsterdam en te Haarlem.*

Let us now mention some of the publications dealing with the bordering churches along the Lower Rhine and Northwest Germany

[55] Neff, D. Christian, *Mennonitische Welt-Hilfs-Konferenz, 1930, in Danzig* (Karlsruhe); Neff, D. Christian, *Der Allgemeine Kongress der Mennoniten gehalten in Amsterdam, Elspeet, Witmarsum (Holland) 29. Juni bis 3. Juli 1936* (Karlsruhe); See also *MQR,* January, 1937.

which until recent time were a cultural and linguistic unit with those of The Netherlands. There is valuable material in Max Goebel's *Geschichte des christlichen Lebens in der rheinisch-westfälischen evangelischen Kirche* (Koblenz, 1849-1860). Karl Rembert is the author of many publications on the Mennonites along the Lower Rhine, among them *Die Wiedertäufer im Herzogtum Jülich* (Berlin, 1899). It was largely through the Mennonites that Krefeld became the center for the textile industry. This subject is treated by Paul Koch in his doctoral dissertation, *Der Einfluss des Calvinismus und des Mennonitentums auf die Niederrheinische Textilindustrie. Ein Beitrag zu Max Webers: "Die Protestantische Ethik und der Geist des Kapitalismus"* (Krefeld, 1928). (See critical review by Ernest Correll in MENNONITE QUARTERLY REVIEW, January, 1931.) One of the most recent contributions concerning the Mennonites in this region is *Beiträge zur Geschichte rheinischer Mennoniten* published by *Mennonitischer Geschichtsverein* (Weierhof, 1939). In his book, *William Penn and the Dutch Quaker Migration to Pennsylvania* (Swarthmore, Pa., 1935), W. J. Hull has made a significant contribution to the story of the migration of the Quaker-Mennonites from Krefeld to Germantown. His findings have not remained unchallenged. Especially the Mennonites of Germany objected to his conclusions that the founders of Germantown had been Dutch Quakers and not German Mennonites.[56] A late and thorough study of these problems has been made by Friedrich Nieper in *Die ersten deutschen Auswanderer von Krefeld nach Pennsylvanien. Ein Bild aus der religiösen Ideengeschichte des 17. und 18. Jahrhunderts* (Neukirchen, 1940).[57] The *Mennonitische Geschichtsblätter* published by the *Mennonitischer Geschichtsverein* (Weierhof since 1936) not only contain significant articles on the Mennonites in general, but also regularly list all publications on the Mennonites which appear in either book form or periodicals.

Let us now turn to the Mennonites of North Germany adjacent to The Netherlands. J. P. Müller wrote *Die Mennoniten in Ostfriesland* (Emden, 1887). An earlier history of the Mennonites of Hamburg and Altona was written by B. C. Roosen entitled *Ge-*

[56] See Dr. Karl Rembert's *Zur Geschichte der Auswanderung Krefelder Mennoniten nach Nord-Amerika* in *Beiträge zur Geschichte rheinischer Mennoniten* (1939). He lists additional literature on page 167.

[57] See also the American contribution by C. Henry Smith, *The Mennonite Immigration to Pennsylvania in the Eighteenth Century* (Norristown, Pa., 1929).

schichte der Mennoniten-Gemeinde zu Hamburg und Altona (Hamburg, 1886-1887). More recent are R. Dollinger's *Geschichte der Mennoniten in Schleswig-Holstein, Hamburg, und Lübeck* (Neumünster i. H. 1930), H. Munte, "Das Altonaer Handlungshaus van der Smissen, 1682-1824" in *Altonaische Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Heimatkunde,* II (1932) 1-174, and shorter contributions by Otto Schowalter in *Kulturleistungen der Hamburger Mennoniten. Schiffahrt-Industrie-Welthandel,* and Dr. Ernst Crous in *Der Beitrag der Mennoniten zum Wiederaufbau Deutschlands im Zeitalter des Dreissigjährigen Krieges* (*Mennonitische Geschichtsblätter,* Nos. 1-2, 1938, 22-48). Additional literature in these fields can be found under the respective articles in *ML* and the *Catalogus* (331-334).[58]

The connection of the early Baptists and Pilgrim Fathers with the Mennonites of Holland is treated in J. G. De Hoop Scheffer, *De Brownisten Te Amsterdam* (Amsterdam, 1881) in *Versl. En Meded. Afd. Letterk. 2de Reeks. Deel X,* 203-280, and 302-399; English translation, *History of the Free Churchmen in the Dutch Republic* 1581-1701 (Ithaca, 1922). See *Catalogus* 156-159 for other literature on this subject.

The connection with the Quakers in Holland is best treated (from the Quaker viewpoint!) in the exhaustive series of ten monographs by W. L. Hull in the series called *Swarthmore College Monographs on Quaker History* (1934-), intended to be a complete history of Quakerism in Holland. See particularly numbers 4 and 5, *The Rise of Quakerism in Amsterdam, 1655-1665,* and *Benjamin Furly, 1636-1714, and the Rise of Quakerism in Rotterdam.*

3. *Biographies and Genealogies*

Melchior Hofmann was the medium through which Anabaptism was spread from South Germany to the Low Countries. He expounded his teachings in a number of books. For these reasons considerable literature about him is available. *Teylers Godgeleerd Genootschap* awarded prizes for two biographies and published them. One was written by W. I. Leendertz entitled *Melchior Hofmann* (Haarlem, 1883), and the other by F. O. zur Linden entitled *Melchior Hofmann, ein Prophet der Wiedertäufer* (Haarlem,

[58] See also H. Corsten, *Rheinische Bibliographie,* I (Köln, 1938), Nos. 6978-7044; and Christiaan Sepp, *Bibliotheek der Nederlandsche Kerkgeschiedschrijvers* (Leiden, 1886), 397-399.

1885). Samuel Cramer edited Melchior Hofmann's writings, adding a valuable introduction which was published in 1909 as volume V of *BRN*.

The literature on the Münsterite Anabaptists is readily accessible and will, therefore, be omitted here. The most recent treatments of this subject are Fritz Blanke's *Das Reich der Wiedertäufer zu Münster 1534/35,* and Walter Köhler's *Das Täufertum in der neueren kirchenhistorischen Forschung (Archiv für Reformations-Geschichte,* Heft 1, vol. 37, 1940, 13-37; 93-102).[59]

The latest biography which lists all the literature by and about David Joris, who for a while lived and labored in The Netherlands, is written by Roland H. Bainton and entitled *David Joris Wiedertäufer und Kämpfer für Toleranz im 16. Jahrhundert (Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte, Ergänzungsband VI,* Leipzig, 1937).

Throughout the century of Mennonite historiography no other leader was the object of as many studies as Menno Simons. As mentioned previously, it was A. M. Cramer who pioneered in this field by presenting a thorough study, *Het leven en de verrichtingen van Menno Simons* (Amsterdam, 1837), on the occasion of the three-hundredth anniversary of Menno Simons' conversion. Among those who made special contributions in this field we mention J. C. de Hoop Scheffer,[60] Samuel Cramer,[61] G. E. Frerichs,[62] and Karel Vos. The research work of the latter has been previously mentioned in connection with his controversy with W. Kühler concerning the origin of the Anabaptists. Karel Vos' book, *Menno Simons, 1496-1561, Zijn leven en werken en zijne reformatorische denkbeelden* (Leiden, 1914), is well documented and gives evidence that the author is the best authority on the sources in that field. However, Vos does not remain on that high level in interpreting and presenting the facts. His cold and rationalistic approach blinds him occasionally to the real forces at work and fails to create interest and enthusiasm for the man of whom he is writing. Two years later, John Horsch published *Menno Simons, His Life, Labors and Teachings* (Scottdale, 1916). Horsch's conservative Mennonite back-

[59] The promised continuations of these articles are seemingly unobtainable due to war conditions.

[60] See especially *Eenige opmerkingen en mededeelingen betr. Menno Simons, DB,* 1863, 1865, 1872, 1881, 1889, 1890, 1892, 1894.

[61] *Menno Simons, RE*[3].

[62] *Menno's taal, DB,* 905. *Menno's verblijf in de eerste jaaren na zijn uitgang, DB,* 1906.

ground enabled him in many instances to interpret Menno Simons more accurately than Vos did, even though he could not master the sources as well as Vos, who was a native of the country of Menno Simons and a born archivist. Occasionally it seems as though Vos finds secret pleasure in ridiculing Menno Simons' beliefs and teachings while Horsch's interpretations of them are sometimes of a defensive nature.

In 1848 two German biographies of Menno Simons were published. B. C. Roosen wrote *Menno Simons den evangelischen Mennoniten-Gemeinden geschildert* (Leipzig, 1848) and C. Harder, *Das Leben Menno Symons* (Königsberg, 1846). On the fourhundredth anniversary of the conversion of Menno Simons, Cornelius Krahn presented his study, *Menno Simons (1496-1561), Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte und Theologie der Taufgesinnten* (Karlsruhe i. B., 1936). The first part is a biography of Menno Simons and the second an interpretation of the theology of Menno Simons and the Anabaptists as compared with that of the reformers of the sixteenth century.[63] Recent American brief biographies are *Menno Simons, Apostle of the Nonresistant Life* (Berne, 1936), by C. Henry Smith, and *Menno Simon's Life and Writings* (*Scottdale*, 1936), by Harold S. Bender and John Horsch. In this connection, *De portretten van Menno Simons (Met 12 afbeeldingen), (DB,* Leiden, 1916) by G. J. Boekenoogen should be mentioned. A scholarly edition of the orginal writings of Menno Simons has not yet been published, although an English edition appeared in 1871 under the title, *The Complete Works of Menno Simons* (Elkhart, Ind.)

The writings of Obbe Phillips,[64] Dirk Philips,[65] and Adam Pastor[66] have been edited by S. Cramer and F. Pijper who wrote introductions which contain the best available information concerning their lives. Complete biographies of these and other co-workers of Menno Simons have not yet been written.

More than thirty biographies, partly illustrated, of the great

[63] This book contains a list of writings by and about Menno Simons complete to 1936.

[64] By S. Cramer in *BRN,* VII (1910).

[65] By F. Pijper in *BRN,* X (1914). An English edition of Dirk Philips' *Enchiridion* appeared at Elkhart, Ind., in 1915. Before this time many German editions had appeared both in Europe and America.

[66] By S. Cramer in *BRN,* A. H. Newman wrote "Adam Pastor, Antitrinitarian Antipaedobaptist," in *Papers of the American Society of Church History,* V. 1917.

Mennonite leaders of the first century are given in the second and third volumes of Schyn-Maatschoen's previously mentioned history of the Mennonites. K. de Wit published thirty illustrations of leading men in *Verzaamelingen van de afbeeldingen van veele voornaame mannen en leeraaren* (Amsterdam, MDCCXLIII); each illustration was accompanied by a short poem written by J. van den Vondel, Adr. Spinniker, and others. C. B. Hylkema, *Reformateurs* (2 vols., Haarlem, 1900-02), contains several Anabaptist biographies.

The most easily accessible biographies of all significant leaders and other influential men can be found in the *ML* as far as it has been published. Literature by and about the early Anabaptist leaders is listed in *Catalogus,* 61-97, for the later period 155, 156, 297-303. Genealogies can be found in the *Catalogus,* 44-48. Kurt Kauenhowen published a bibliography in this field about those Mennonites who left the Netherlands and settled in Prussia. It is entitled *Das Schrifttum zur Sippenkunde und Geschichte der taufgesinnten niederlandischen Einwanderer (Mennoniten) in Altpreussen und ihrer Abzweigungen.*[67]

4. *Characteristics and Principles*

We shall not attempt to mention all of the literature which deals with Mennonite tenets, beliefs, teachings, and principles. We will merely name a few outstanding titles of the past and present centuries. Professor J. H. Scholten's *De Leer der Hervormde Kerk,* in which he characterized the Anabaptists, caused D. S. Gorter's *Onderzoek naar het kenmerkend beginsel der Nederlandsche Doopsgezinden* (1850), and S. Hoekstra's *Nog iets over het eigenlijke wezen van den Doopsgezinden Christen* (1851). All this was just a prelude to the most significant work written on this subject by a Dutch theologian. This was *Beginselen en leer der oude Doopsgezinden, vergeleken met de overige Protestanten* (Amsterdam, 1863), by Syste Hoekstra Bz,[68] who was professor at the Mennonite Theological Seminary and the University of Amsterdam. Hoekstra, one of the greatest Dutch philosophers and theologians of his century and a writer of numerous books in systematic theology, made a thorough comparative study of the Mennonite and other

[67] *Mitteilungen der Niederländischen Ahnengemeinschaft e. V.,* (Hamburg, 1939), I, 66-109.

[68] For his biography, his writings, and literature on him see J. Loosjes, art. "S. Hoekstra," *ML,* II 323-325.

Protestant teachings and principles. Other Dutch Mennonite scholars may have had better mastery of the sources, but it is doubtful if any had a keener insight into the essentials of Mennonitism. It is regretable that this standard work, which is not out-dated even at the present time, has found so little consideration not only abroad but also among European scholars. As Luther's theological concern centers around the *sola fide,* and Calvin's around the sovereignty and will of God, so does the Anabaptist, according to Hoekstra, center in the New Testament *ecclesia.* Contrary to this interpretation of the essentials of Anabaptism, Kühler, in his previously mentioned history of the Dutch Mennonites, constructs the theory that the genuine Anabaptism is that of individual piety which throughout Mennonite history struggles with the strictly supervised and disciplined *ecclesia.* According to Kühler, therefore, the martyrs, the Waterlanders, and other liberal factions represent genuine Anabaptism, while the strict and conservative followers of Menno Simons have deviated from it. Thus the liberal "Doopsgezinde" religious beliefs of the nineteenth century are conjectured into the sixteenth century Anabaptism.

We shall not here attempt to present the interpretations of the essential principles of Anabaptism as they are given by well-known historians, Albrecht Ritschl, Ludwig Keller, Karl Holl, Ernst Troeltsch, Max Weber, Walter Köhler, and others. We will merely mention a few significant recent publications in this field. A helpful treatise is Ethelbert Stauffer's "Märtyrertheologie und Täuferbewegung."[69] According to this work, the outstanding characteristic of Anabaptism is willingness to suffer for the Lord. The martyrs went through a threefold baptism—with the spirit, with the water, and with the blood. The willingness to suffer, which the Dutch call "lijdzaamheid," finds expression in the principle of nonresistance. How this principle was given up by the Dutch Mennonites is described by S. Cramer in "Hoe een van onze vroegere kenmerken is te neit gegaan" (*DB,* Leiden, 1898), and by Vos in *De weerloosheid der Doopsgezinden* (Amsterdam, 1916). See also the study by J. Dyserinck, "De Weerloosheid volgens de Doopsgezinden" in *De Gids,* 1890. The latest Dutch study of this field (and by a supporter of the principle) was made by N. van der Zijpp in *De vroegere Doopsgezinden en de krijgsdienst* (Wolvega,

[69] *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte,* XV (1933), 545-598. See the critical English summary of this discussion by Ernst Correll in *MQR,* July, 1934, (VIII) 140-143.

1930). The most thorough study with emphasis on Dutch sources is *Die Wehrfreiheit der altpreussischen Mennoniten* (Marienburg, 1863) by W. Mannhardt. An English survey was made by John Horsch entitled *The Principle of Nonresistance as Held by the Mennonite Church* (Second ed., Scottdale, Pa., 1939).[70]

The most detailed Dutch account of the development of modes of baptism was given by J. G. de Hoop-Scheffer in his *Oversicht der Geschiedenis van den Doop bij Onderdompeling.*[71] Karel Vos wrote "De doop bij overstorting" (*DB,* Leiden, 1911). Baptism by immersion was not entirely unknown among the early Anabaptists; however, the prevalent mode was sprinkling or pouring. Due to the influence of the Socinians, Baptists, and others, some churches adopted baptism by immersion.[72]

Menno Simons and his followers shared a peculiar conception of the incarnation of Christ held by Melchior Hofmann. Krahn's discourse on *Der Gemeindebegriff Mennos im Zusammenhang mit seiner Lehre von der Menschwerdung Christi*[73] attempts to point out the connection between this doctrine and their conception of a church "without spot and wrinkle." Irvin E. Burkhart wrote "Menno Simons on the Incarnation" (*MQR,* April and July, 1930, April, 1932).

Regarding the Mennonite principle of nonconformity, a few titles deserve special mention. P. Langendijk gives an account of the complaints of the Swiss Mennonites who settled in The Netherlands, about the worldliness of their Dutch brethren.[74] C. N. Wybrands portrays the cultural and ethical standards of past conservatism of the Dutch Mennonites in *Het Menniste Zusje* (Amsterdam, 1913). Y. Buruma wrote on marriage among the Mennonites in his book entitled *Het Huwelijk der Doopsgezinden in de zestiende Eeuw* (1911). See also Correll, art. "Ehe" in *ML* I, 509-526.

70 For further literature on nonresistance and the oath see *Catalogus,* 181, 184, 185, 303-305; and Correll, art. "Friedensbewegung," *ML,* I 706-713. See also W. J. Kühler, "De weerlosheid en de overige kenmerken der oude Doopsgezinden" in *Zondagsbode,* June 22, 1930, 145-6.

71 *Verslagen en Mededeedlingen der Koninklijke Academie van Wetenschappen, Afd. Letterkunde, 2 reeks, dl. XII,* (Amsterdam, 1883).

72 Further literature: *Cat.,* 174-181, 303-304. See also J. Horsch, "Did Menno Simons Practice Baptism by Immersion?" *MQR,* Jan. 1927 (I) 54-56.

73 *op. cit.* 155-161; additional literature, *Cat.,* 181-184.

74 *De Zwitsere Eenvoudigheid, klagende over de bedorvene Zeden veeler Hollandse Doopsgezinden.* (Haarlem, 1713); see *Cat.,* 189.

The above-mentioned willingness to suffer and the principles of nonconformity and nonresistance found an interpretation in the work of Adolf Ehrt, in his chapter on *Wesen des Mennonitentums.*[75] His observations regarding the essence of the Anabaptist *ecclesia* and the Anabaptist attitude toward the society in which they live, however, fall short because of too consistent generalizations and his failure to see the aggressive spirit of the church of the martyrs. Fritz Heyer attempts to give a *"dogmengeschichtliche Zusammenfassung"* of the sects of the Reformation in *Der Kirchenbegriff der Schwärmer* (Leipzig, 1939), and Ulrich Bergfried wrote a dissertation under Karl Heim entitled *Verantwortung als theologisches Problem im Täufertum des 16. Jahrhunderts* (Wuppertal-Elberfeld, 1938).[76] Three American interpreters of Dutch Anabaptism are Henry Elias Dosker, C. Henry Smith, John Horsch. Most outstanding among their publications are *The Dutch Anabaptists* (Philadelphia, 1921), *The Story of the Mennonites* (Berne, 1941), and *Mennonites in Europe* (Scottdale, 1942), respectively. The most recent interpretation of the essence of Anabaptism is H. S. Bender's "The Anabaptist Vision" in *Church History* (March, 1944), and *MQR* (April, 1944).

5. *Worship, Devotion, and Literature*

In no other country do the Mennonites have such a wealth of literature in the fields of worship, devotion, confessions of faith, and religious education. Also in no other country have they taken as active a part in the cultural, economic, and political activities of the nation. For example, writers and painters of renown, like Carel van Mander, Joost van den Vondel, Jan Luyken, Pieter Langendijk, and even Rembrandt are listed among them. The article, "Die Mennoniten in der holländischen Literatur" (*ML,* II, 669-672) by H. F. W. Jeltes, lists the writings on and by Dutch Mennonites and gives a bibliography in this field.[77]

In spite of the abundance of literature in the above-mentioned

[75] *Das Mennonitentum in Russland von seiner Einwanderung bis zur Gegenwart* (Berlin-Leipzig, 1932).

[76] Because of war conditions, these books were not available but detailed reviews appeared in *Mennonitische Geschichtsblätter* by Chr. Neff and W. Köhler (August, 1940, 10-19, 48-52). Both reviews are very critical.

[77] An English translation appeared in *MQR,* April, 1937, 142-155.

fields, little has been done to treat the different subjects in a historical and systematic manner. Since much of this literature, in its German and English translations, has influenced American Mennonitism, it offers an unexplored field for research for the American student of *Anabaptistica.* However, the work has been started. Robert Friedmann wrote an article on the "Dutch Mennonite Devotional Literature from Peter Peters to Johannes Deknatel, 1625-1753" (*MQR,* July, 1941), and another on "Mennonite Prayer Books, Their Story and Their Meaning" (*MQR,* October, 1943). Walter H. Hohmann has paved the way for a more exhaustive study of Mennonite hymnology in his *Outlines in Hymnology with Emphasis on Mennonite Hymnology* (North Newton, Kansas, 1941). S. Cramer made thorough studies in this field which were published in *DB* (1900, 1902). The article on "Gesangbücher" in *ML,* and R. Wolkan's *Die Lieder der Wiedertäufer* (Berlin, 1903), should be mentioned in this connection.[78]

F. S. Knipscheer wrote an exhaustive study concerning the controversy on silent and audible prayer in "Geschiedenis van het stil en het stimmelijk gebed bij de Nederlandsche Doopsgezinden (*DB,* 1897, 1898).[79] In "Reizen naar de Eeuwigheid" (*DB,* 1896), J. J. Honig Jr. makes a study of one of the most popular devotional books entitled *Wegh nae Vredenstadt* (1625) by Pieter Pietersz. Books in the field of devotion and theology are listed in *Catalogus,* 212-239, 306-310. Sermons are found on 239-256, 310-324. The extensive literature in the field of religious education is given on the pages 256-265, 324-329.

The Dutch Mennonites had their own Bible translations. S. Müller wrote on this subject in *Het onstaan en het gebruik van Bijbelvertalingen onder de Nederlandsche Doopsgezinden.*[80] Also the articles "Bibelübersetzungen" and "Biestkens-Bibel" in *ML* give valuable information concerning the Bible translations which were used by the Anabaptists. Pieter Jansz Twisk, one of the most prolific Mennonite writers of the seventeenth century, wrote a Bible concordance entitled *Concordantie der Heyligher Schriftvren enz.* (Hoorn, 1615), which was generally used. He added a second volume, *Bybelsch Naem-ende Chronyck-boeck* (Hoorn, 1632).

[78] *Catalogus,* 265-279, 329-331.

[79] *Catalogus,* 188.

[80] In *Jaarboekje voor Doopsgezinde gemeenten* (1837).

Let us conclude by mentioning a field in which very little work has been done. We refer to the Dutch confessions of faith which are listed in *Catalogus,* 168-173, 353 (see also Neff. art. "Bekenntnisse des Glaubens" in *ML,* I, 157-161). The Dordrecht Confession of 1632 has become the standard confession for the majority of the American Mennonites and has been repeatedly printed in German and English editions. The Cornelius Ris confession of 1766 is also used by a large group in America, and has been reprinted several times in English and German.

CONCLUSION

We have seen that the Dutch Mennonites have been most consistent in establishing a church "without spot or wrinkle." They practiced the principle of nonconformity to "the world" more rigidly than any other Mennonite church. They wrote more on this subject and produced more literature in the fields of devotion, worship, confessions of faith, and theology than any other Mennonite church. They were the first to overcome the divisions which resulted from their concept of a church "of saints." They were the first among the Mennonites to live in a country of religious freedom and to share the nation's blessings during its Golden Age. This sharing in cultural values and the consequent secularization also produced a wealth of literature. The Dutch Mennonites were the first to do relief work on a big scale among their suffering brethren.

American Mennonitism is now beginning to analyze its tenets, doctrines, and heritage. In doing so it has turned first to its Swiss background. This is justified because the Swiss Mennonites were the first to settle in this country and their descendants form the majority of the Mennonites in America. But in the future of American Mennonite research more attention will have to be given to Dutch Mennonitism. In the first place, the sources of Swiss Mennonite literature on which research is based are limited, in comparison to Dutch Mennonite literature. Secondly, the Mennonites of Swiss background were influenced more by the Dutch literature than by their own. Thirdly, Dutch Mennonitism faced problems and made developments some one hundred and more years ago which American Mennonitism faces today and will face tomorrow. These problems and their solutions are reflected in Dutch Mennonite literature and in the Dutch Mennonite church

of today. A study and knowledge of these problems and their solutions may help American Mennonitism to solve its present and future problems.

The purpose of this paper is to call attention to the wealth of Dutch source material, which is essential to any study of Anabaptism, and to furnish a guide to the same.

IV. General Sourses of *Anabaptistica Neerlandica*

1. *Libraries and Archives*

The most complete collection of books and documents on *Anabaptistica* is to be found in the library and archives of the Mennonite Church of Amsterdam, Holland. Smaller collections are located in the libraries of the universities of Amsterdam, Leyden, Groningen, and Kiel, the Koninglijke Bibliotheek at The Hague, the British Museum, and certain church and private libraries among the Mennonites of The Netherlands and Germany.

The collections of Dutch *Mennonitica* in America are rather scarce. Special efforts are being made to preserve and collect everything in connection with the history of the Mennonites, including the Dutch, by the Mennonite historical societies and libraries of Bethel College, North Newton, Kansas; Goshen College, Goshen, Indiana; Bluffton College, Bluffton, Ohio; Mennonite Publishing House, Scottdale, Pa.; and Tabor College, Hillsboro, Kansas. A number of other college, university, and theological seminary libraries in the United States have some material along this line, particularly Harvard University, Union Theological Seminary, New York; Colgate-Rochester Divinity School, Rochester, N. Y., and Crozer Theological Seminary, Chester, Pa.; also the Schwenkfelder Historical Library, Perkiomenville, Pa.

2. *Bibliographies and Catalogs*

(J. G. Boekenogen), *Catalogus der werken over de Doopsgezinden en hunne geschiedenis aanwezig in de bibliotheek der Vereenigde Doopsgezinde Gemeente te Amsterdam* (Amsterdam, 1919). Quoted in this article as Catalogus.

Roland H. Bainton, *Bibliography of the Continental Reformation,* (Chicago, 1935).

Harold S. Bender, "Recent Progress in Research in Anabaptist History," *MQR,* VIII (1934), 3-17.

Fritz Blanke, "Das Reich der Wiedertäufer zu Münster 1534/35" (*Archiv für Reformations-Geschichte,* Heft I, vol. 37 1940).

H. Corsten, *Rheinische Bibliographie,* (Köln, 1938), I, Nos. 6978-7044.

Chr. Hege, "Geschichtsschreibung" in *Mennonitisches Lexikon,* II, 97-98.

H. F.W. Jeltes, "Die Mennoniten in der holländischen Literatur" in *ML,* II, 669-672. English translation in *MQR,* April, 1937, 142-155.

(John Horsch), *Catalogue of the Mennonite Historical Library in Scottdale, Pennsylvania* (Scottdale, Pa., 1929).

Katalog der Kirchenbibliothek der Mennonitengemeinde zu Danzig (Danzig, 1869).

Kurt Kauenhowen, *Das Schrifttum zur Sippenkunde und Geschichte der taufgesinnten niederländischen Einwanderer (Mennoniten) in Altpreussen und ihrer Abzweigungen* (Vol. I of *Mitteilungen der Niederländischen Ahnengemeinschaft e. V., Hamburg,* 1939).

Walter Köhler, "Das Täufertum in der neueren kirchengeschichtlichen Forschung: I. Allgemeines" (*Archiv für Reformations-Geschichte,* Heft 1, XXXVII, 1940). Was to be continued.

Cornelius Krahn, *Menno Simons. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte und Theologie der Taufgesinnten* (Karlsruhe, 1936), 9-12, 181-189.

W. Nijhoff en M. E. Kronenberg, *Nederlandsche Bibliographie van 1500-1540* (Den Haag, 1923).

Wilhelm Pauck, "The Historiography of the German Reformation During the Past Twenty Years" (*Church History,* IX, December, 1940), 335-340.

J. G. de Hoop Scheffer, *Inventaris der Archiefstukken berustende bij de Vereenigde Doopsgezinde Gemeente te Amsterdam* (Amsterdam, 1883-84).

Karl Schottenloher, *Bibliographie zur deutschen Geschichte im Zeitalter der Glaubensspaltung 1517-1585* (Leipzig, 1933-39), 5 vols.

H. van der Smissen, *Katalog von der Bibliothek der Mennoniten Gemeinde zu Hamburg und Altona* (Altona, 1890).

Chr. Sepp, *Bibliothek der Nederlandsche Kerkgeschiedschrijvers* (Leyden, 1886).

E. Teufel, "Täufertum und Quäkertum im Lichte der neueren Forschung I." (*Theologische Rundschau, Neue Folge,* 13. Jhrg., 1941, Heft 1/2, 21-28).

3. *Editions, Encyclopedias, and Periodicals.*

Most of the periodicals can be found in the *Union List of Serials in Libraries of the United States and Canada* and are therefore accessible.

Acta der Provinciale en Particuliere Synoden (I-VII, 1892-1898). Edited by Reitsma and Van Veen.

Archief voor Kerkelijke Geschiedenis (Leyden, 1829-1849).

Bibliotheca Reformatoria Neerlandica. Edited by S. Cramer and F. Pijper. (The Hague, 1904-1912, 10 volumes). Abbreviated: *BRN.*

Bijdragen tot eene Nederlandsche Bibliographie (Amsterdam, 1884-1931).

Biographisch Woordenboek van Protestantsche Godgeleerden in Nederland. Edited by J. P. de Bie and Loosjes (The Hague).

Corpus documentorum inquisitionis haereticae pravitatis Neerlandicae. Edited by Julius Fredericq (Gent, 1889-1906, 5 volumes).

Doopsgezinde Bijdragen, (Leyden, 1861-1919). Abbreviated: *DB.*

Doopsgezinde Bijdragen. Register op de vijftig eerste jaargangen daarvan, 1861-1910; benevens op S. Muller, Jaarboekje, 1837-1850; en D. S. Gorter, Godsdienstige lectuur voor Doopsgezinden, 1854-1858 (Leyden, 1912).

Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart. Edited by Schiele and Zscharnack (Tübingen, 1912, first edition). See also the later edition.

Geschrifties ten behoeve van de Doopsgezinden in de verstrooiing. (Amsterdam, Nos. 1-60).

Gids (Amsterdam, 1837+).

Godgeleerde Bijdragen (Amsterdam, Leyden, 1827-1879).

Godsdienstige lectuur voor Doopsgezinden. Edited by D. S. Gorter (Sneek, 1854- 1858).

Historisch Genootschap te Utrecht. Berigten, (1846-1863).

Historisch Genootschap te Utrecht. Bijdragen en Mededelingen, (1877+).

Jaarboekje voor de Doopsgezinde gemeenten in de Nederlanden. Edited by S. Muller. (Amsterdam, 1837-1850).

Maatschappij der Nederlandsche Letterkunde te Leiden. Levensberichten, (1864+). For further publications see *Union List of serials.*

Mennonitische Blätter (Danzig, 1854+).

Mennonitische Geschichtsblätter (Weierhof, 1936+).

Mennonitisches Lexikon. Edited by Chr. Hege and Chr. Neff (Frankfurt a. M. and Weierhof, 1913+). Complete from A-M. Abbreviated: *ML.*

Mennonite Quarterly Review (Goshen, Ind., 1927+). Abbreviated: *MQR.*

Nederlandsche Bibliographie (Leyden, Utrecht, 1912+).

Nieuw Theologisch Tijdschrift (Haarlem, 1912+).

Realencyklopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche. Edited by Hauck-Herzog, (Leipzig, 1898-1906). See also the second and third editions.

Schriftenreihe des Mennonitischen Geschichtsvereins, (Weierhof, 1938+).

Theologisch Tijdschrift (Amsterdam, Leyden, 1867-1919).

Zondagsbode. Doopsgezind Weekblad (1887+).

EXTINCT OHIO MENNONITE CHURCHES

III. Seneca County (Concluded)

JOHN UMBLE

In 1845, John C., son of Michael Z. and Hannah Hunsicker, bought forty-five acres for eighteen hundred dollars in Venice Township three miles east and two miles south of the Mennonite church. He purchased several lots in Bloomville in 1848 and 1849 and became one of the first dry goods merchants in the village. Nathaniel, infant son of J. C. and L. K. Hunsicker was buried in the Mennonite cemetery southeast of Bloomville on December 2, 1851. Levina, wife of John C. died July 18, 1853, at the age of thirty-five and was buried in the same cemetery. Gravestones in the cemetery indicate that John C. Hunsicker's second wife was Elizabeth. The son of J. C. and Elizabeth is buried in the Mennonite cemetery. He died in 1858. Another Hunsicker infant was buried in the same cemetery in 1864. When Elizabeth, the wife of John C. Hunsicker died in Kitchener, Ontario, on June 8, 1876, Rev. J. McNally preached the funeral sermon. This may indicate that she was not a member of the Mennonite church. But for a number of years after he moved to Ontario, J. C. Hunsicker was the Canadian representative of John F. Funk's publishing house in Elkhart, Indiana.

Anna, daughter of Michael Z. and Hannah (Clemens) Hunsicker, born in Montgomery County, Pennsylvania, moved to Seneca County with her parents and there on November 15, 1857, married Conrad Briner born in Baden, Germany, on November 8, 1830. He was a member of the Reformed Church. Anna, however, was a Mennonite and reared her children in that faith. John and Sophia Briner, the parents of Conrad, were natives of Germany and settled in Bloom Township in 1852. Conrad and Anna (Hunsicker) Briner owned a two-hundred-and-forty-acre farm near Bloomville.

Another Hunsicker family, Isaac and Mary, lived in the Seneca County Mennonite settlement during the early years. Mary died on March 14, 1840, at the age of twenty-six and is buried in the Mennonite cemetery. Her infant child had died five days earlier. Her husband may have been the Isaac Z. Hunsicker who was born in Montgomery County, Pennsylvania, on January 27, 1803, and died

at Kitchener, Ontario, May 22, 1870. If so, the Seneca County Michael Z. and Isaac Hunsicker probably were brothers.

The name Hunsicker seems to have disappeared both in Seneca County, Ohio, and in Waterloo County, Ontario. The Isaac C. Hunsicker who died at Skippack in Montgomery County, Pennsylvania, may have been a brother to the Seneca County John C. There is some evidence that when the Hunsickers moved to Canada they were accompanied by some of the Troxels.[10]

Another Mennonite family in the community were the Lehmans. Nicholas Lehman bought several tracts of land in Venice and Bloom Townships in the early forties. He sold sixty acres two miles south and seven miles east of the Mennonite church to Anthony Lehman in 1843 and eight acres about two miles south of the church to Balsar Lehman in 1848. One of the Lehmans, John S., who died in 1901, mentioned the following next of kin in a will dated April 17, 1899: Elizabeth, Noah S., Mary Olds, Levi L., Uriah E., Jacob, A. J., and H. H. The Lehman homestead lies on the south side of the road running east and west past the old Mennonite cemetery. It faces west and is located on the southeast corner of the first intersection west of the cemetery. All of the Lehmans who were buried in the Mennonite cemetery have been removed to Woodlawn. A member of this family, Don Lehman, living southeast of Bloomville on the old Lehman homestead in 1930, assisted the writer that year in collecting material for this history. He still preserved the "Menese bonnet" of his mother who had died a Mennonite and was buried in the Woodlawn cemetery. The bonnet was of the slat type with a long crown supported by strips of pasteboard and with a large apron at the back that hung down over the neck and shoulders. He fondly cherished the memory of his plain, pious parents.

A certain Elizabeth Shupe was born in Seneca County on November 15, 1831. In Mahoning County, Ohio, in 1847, she married David Metzler, a native of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania. They purchased four acres for $250 in the northwest quarter of Section Twenty-three about a mile west of the Seneca County Mennonite church on May 14, 1847. They moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, after a number of years, where David Metzler died on November 28, 1887. Both were members of the Old Order Men-

[10] See obituary notice of Isaac Z. Hunsicker and the infant daughter of John and Elizabeth Troxel in *Herald of Truth,* VII (July, 1870), 111.

nonite (Wisler) Church in Elkhart County. Mrs. Metzler was the mother of eleven children, and according to her obituary notice two daughters and six sons survived her at her death, March 25, 1901.

Some of the earlier Behms were Mennonites. Christian Behm died in Bloomville on April 7, 1876, at the age of seventy-four. Services were conducted by Stephen A. Walker and Isaac Rohrer. It was the custom in those days to have funeral services conducted in two languages—in German by the Mennonite minister and in English by a minister of some other denomination. The obituary of Mary Behm, who died on December 27, 1873, states that she had been a "sister in the Mennonite Church about forty years," and that the the services were conducted by Isaac Rohrer and —— Schantz. It is said that the Behms always buried in the Woodlawn cemetery. A Behm infant, however, is buried in the Mennonite cemetery. The aged Mrs. Behm who now lives southeast of Bloomville came to Seneca County in 1884. She was a Geiger from a former Mennonite community, near Lakeville and North Liberty, Indiana. At present the Behms hold their membership in the Reformed and Methodist Churches.

Another family of Mennonites were the Zutaverns (pronounced zoot-a-vin). Jacob B. Zutavern, who was born August 15, 1853, and died March 8, 1900, is buried in the Woodlawn Cemetery west of Bloomville. His wife, Efa (*sic*), who was born September 7, 1853, and died January 20, 1914, is buried beside him. According to the History of Seneca County, a Jacob H. Zutavern, born in Baden, Germany, came to America with his parents about 1813 at the age of eight. The family settled in Tuscarawas County, Ohio, where he married Margaret Geiger.[11] A certain Margaret Zutavern on April 1, 1875, purchased a small tract of land for $650 in the north half of Section Twenty-four (the section lying south across the road from the Mennonite church.)

Apparently the Rothegapes or Rodegebs always buried their dead in Woodlawn Cemetery west of Bloomville. Here lie Kate, born January 13, 1839, died May 12, 1896, and Maggie G., daughter of D. and K. Rodegeb, born December 8, 1879, died February 8, 1886. Jacob and Magdalene (Neiswander) Rodegeb moved from Virginia. Jacob Rodegeb was born January 31, 1795, and as a young

11 *Centennial Biographical History of Seneca County*, p. 382. Some of the items in this biographical sketch are contradicted by another on p. 252.

man entered 240 acres in Bloom Township. This would indicate that Jacob Rodegeb might have been one of the first Mennonite settlers in the community. It is possible that he learned of Seneca County through some of his Fairfield County, Ohio, friends. The history of Seneca County states that Jacob Rodegeb died in August 9, 1850, and his wife, Magadalene, in 1877. Both are buried in Woodlawn Cemetery. This seems to be the Jacob Rothgape who was one of the first trustees of the Seneca County Mennonite Church.

An Allderffer family lived in the Mennonite settlement between 1841 and 1851. Although the graves receive better care than some of the others and the gravestones have been reset in cement during the past few years, the only record of this family that the writer could find is on the slabs that mark the graves. John, a two-year-old son of Frederick and Mary (Fry or Fryan) Allderffer, died March 5, 1841. Beside her son repose the remains of the mother who died in 1851 at the age of forty. On February 6, 1847, Frederick Allderfer sold twenty acres three miles west and a quarter mile south of the church to Christian Brand. Allderffer died July 7, 1853, at the age of 43.

Henry Kroft who died in 1864 and was buried in the Mennonite cemetery probably was a member of the Mennonite Church. His son, Jacob, was a Mennonite. A certain John Kroft gave his residence as "Ohio" when he purchased a quarter section about six miles northeast of Bucyrus. He and his wife Elizabeth sold this tract at a profit in 1832 and purchased a quarter section six miles south of the future location of the Seneca County Mennonite church. It is not certain that he was a Mennonite. A family named Kraft lived in the Richland County Mennonite settlement south of Ashland, Ohio, about 1834. They were either Mennonite, Lutheran or Reformed and had emigrated, apparently, from the Bavarian Palatinate.

The early settlers of Crawford County were largely German immigrants or at least of German extraction. A certain Catholic priest in Galion was named Kaempfer which was the name also of the last Mennonite minister in Wood County. Many of the early settlers in Crawford bore names that might have been Mennonite, but they are known to have been United Brethren, Evangelical, Lutheran, German Reformed, and Roman Catholic. A certain Conrad Roth, who was living near Bucyrus in Crawford County, Ohio, purchased land in Venice Township near Attica, some distance

east of where the Mennonite church later was located, on January 4, 1827. It is not certain that he was a Mennonite. The name Conrad usually indicates Lutheran or Reformed connections.

The fact that some Mennonites are known to have lived in Crawford County adjoining Seneca County on the south, has sometimes raised the question whether a Mennonite congregation existed near Bucyrus. Such, however, does not seem to have been the case. A few Mennonites who held their membership at the Mennonite church southeast of Bloomville in Seneca County lived across the line in Crawford County. Some lived not far from Bucyrus, at least sixteen miles south of the church. The Pletchers, Brands, Martins, Gerhardts, and possibly the Ramers, lived in Crawford County but attended the church near Bloomville. A Samuel Ramer who died at Versailles, Missouri, on May 3, 1917, was born in Crawford County, Ohio, November 24, 1840.

The Martins moved to Chatfield Township, Crawford County, in 1853. David Martin was a Mennonite minister. His wife's name was Barbara. Their son, Benjamin, born in Cumberland County, Pennsylvania, on March 9, 1816, married Mary Weaver, born in Cumberland County on December 16, 1824. They were married October 26, 1842, and moved to Chatfield Township with Benjamin Martin's parents. On April 16, 1853, Benjamin Martin purchased the southwest quarter of Section Nine in Chatfield Township, Crawford County, for $2,100. The next year he purchased an additional thirty-five acres for $650. His land lay five miles south and nearly three miles east of the Mennonite meetinghouse in Seneca County.

Preacher David Martin was buried in the Mennonite cemetery southeast of Bloomville and when the son Benjamin Martin died on September 4, 1893, he was buried beside his father. He had been a devoted Bible student and had been a member of the church for forty years, probably having united with the Seneca County Mennonite Church as soon as the family moved to Ohio. He was survived by his wife and children and a number of grandchildren. Since the last services had been held at the Mennonite Church fourteen years earlier, a certain Rev. D. A. Parks had charge of the funeral service.

In 1900 the heirs of Benjamin Martin sold his land in the southwest quarter of Section Nine, Township One South and Range Seventeen East, except thirty-five acres which he had previously sold to Valentine Rookey (Roque or Rocke?) on March 3, 1864. The date

of the transfer was March 6, 1900, and the following signed the deed: S. B. and Emma Martin, J. M. and Isabelle Martin, Emma and J. W. Derr, Peter J. and Emma Martin, all of New Washington, Crawford County, Ohio; H. C. and S. E. Martin, of Montgomery County, Kansas; B. A. Mahan and J. A. Mahan, and J. S. and Samantha Martin of Williams County, Ohio.

Apparently the heirs of Benjamin Martin did not sell the property until the death of their mother. It was probably at her death that they exhumed the bodies of their grandfather and father, David and Benjamin Martin, and reinterred them in Woodlawn.

Several burials of members of Martin families which this research has not been able to connect with the Mennonite Martins, are in the Woodlawn Cemetery: Hannah, wife of William Martin, died May, 1839, aged 73; Thomas W., died April, 1859, aged 25; John Knox Martin, died April, 1862, aged 24; Nancy Jane, daughter of John C. and Mary Ann Martin, died December, 1871, aged 20; John C., died January, 1881, aged 82; and Mary Ann, his wife, died December, 1871, aged 64.

On March 10, 1831, a Jacob Brubaker purchased three acres of land about three miles northeast of Bucyrus. This may be the same Jacob Brubaker who was living near West Millgrove in Wood County twenty years later.[12]

Jacob Bowman, of Stark County, Ohio, purchased forty acres in Section Four, of Township One, Range Seventeen, from the United States Government in 1830. In 1834 Jacob Bowman, Jr., also of Stark County, purchased eighty acres in the same section. Both were still living in Stark County when they purchased eighty acres each in Section Four about a mile north of Benjamin Martin's 1853 purchase. This Jacob Bowman, Jr., was born December 13, 1814, in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, and moved to Stark County, Ohio, in 1832. In 1836, probably in Crawford County, he united with the Mennonite Church, and in 1839 married Susannah Weaver. They moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, in 1850, where he died on July 18, 1898, and was buried in the Clinton Brick Mennonite cemetery. His granddaughter, Mrs. Jacob O. Rink, of rural

[12] See "Extinct Ohio Mennonite Churches: II, Wood County" in *The Mennonite Quarterly Review*, XVIII (April, 1944), 91.

route one, Goshen, Indiana, has a group picture of her grandfather Jacob Bowman's family. (The name is pronounced *bau-man,* not *boh-man.*)

In his report of a visit to the Seneca County congregation in 1868, Bishop John M. Brenneman mentions two Gerhart sisters who lived two miles north of Bucyrus. In the early years of the settlement several families of Gerhardts purchased land in Crawford County between Bucyrus and the Seneca county Mennonite meetinghouse. Christian Gearhard purchased for $119.00 eighty acres from the State of Ohio on August 4, 1834, five miles north of Bucyrus near the village of Broken Sword. In 1847 he purchased an eighty-acre tract which Jacob Gearhart was clearing for Henry Readesel, about seven miles east of Bucyrus and about four miles northwest of Galion.

In 1844 Martin Gerhart purchased ten acres in Crawford County two miles west and nine miles south of the Seneca County Mennonite meetinghouse. Two years later, however, he and his wife, Eve Elizabeth, sold this tract for $150.00. John and Christena Gerhardt in 1834 sold to John Gerhard, Jr., twenty-three acres six miles east of Bucyrus (four miles north and three miles west of Galion). John and Catharine Gerhart sold seventy-three acres in the same quarter section two years later.

Evidently, then, the Gerharts lived in both the Seneca-Crawford congregation near Bloomville and also in the Richland-Crawford settlement in the vicinity of Galion. The writer has not been able to learn whence this family moved to Crawford County. He has not been able to locate any of their descendants nor has he been able to establish any connection between them and any living Mennonite communities.

Tobias Burkhart, who was born in Germany, came to America in 1804 with his widowed mother, Dorothea (Beal) Burkhart. Tobias married Christiana Keiss and located in Crawford County in 1847. In 1870 they moved to Williams County. Their son, George, was married to Rosanna Songer. The latter also was born in Pennsylvania, the daughter of George Songer who came to America in 1815 and married Catherine Ense.

A Sutter family also lived in Crawford County. Charlotte Sutter, the mother, was born in Germany in 1823. A daughter, Lenora Sutter, was born in Crawford County in 1857. Both Charlotte and Lenora died in Williams County, the former in 1889 and

the latter in 1890. It is possible but hardly probable that both the Burkharts and the Sutters were Mennonites.

A certain John Pletcher was born August 2, 1829, in Crawford County, Ohio, and was living at the time of his death (1899) in Elkhart County, Indiana. The funeral service being in charge of George Lambert and John F. Funk at the Olive Church, indicates that he was not a Wisler Mennonite. This John Pletcher was the father of ten children, five sons and five daughters. It is possible that he was the son of the German immigrant, John Plaetscher, who came to America before 1832 and who was mentioned in a letter written to Germany by Rev. John Risser of Haysville, Ohio, in 1834. Risser writes that Pletcher had bought land near Burger (?) which could easily be a mistaken spelling for Bucyrus or a mistaken transcription of the German.

Another John A. Pletcher and his wife Margaret, are buried in the cemetery just east of Broken Sword, seven miles north of Bucyrus. He died in December, 1873, aged 67. His wife Margaret was 78 at her death in January, 1883. The square grave marker of white marble five feet high and topped with drapery (a tasselated table cover), surmounted with a closed Bible supporting an urn, would seem to indicate that this was not a Mennonite family or at least that their children were not Mennonites; but this may be the John Plaetscher, referred to by Rev. John Risser as having purchased land near Burger (?), probably Bucyrus.

The list of subscribers to the *Herald of Truth* printed in that paper during the early years of its publication gives some interesting information in regard to the probable membership in the northern Ohio churches in 1865. The *Herald* lists the following subscribers with Seneca County addresses (the letter E following a name indicates that the subscription was for the English *Herald,* and the letter G, that the subscription was for the German edition, the *Herold der Wahrheit*): Michael Z. Hunsicker E and G; Christ. Legron, E and G; Jacob Detwiler, E; John Newcomer, E; Susanna Knobb, E; David Troxel, E; Pre. Isaac Rohrer, G; Michael Brandt, E and G.

In 1866 several names are added: Christian Bachman, E; Anna Hosler, E; Catherine Becher, G; Magdalene Rodgeb (probably widow of Jacob), G; Elizabeth Brandt of Bucyrus, G; Michael Brandt of Bloomville, E and G. In 1866, Isaac Rohrer subscribed for both the English and German editions.

Following 1866 the addresses are no longer given, and in some cases the minister or some other person in the congregation sends in the entire list of subscriptions. Hence the names of individual subscribers are not printed. But until 1870 the members of this congregation supported the *Herald* rather well. Following that date subscriptions declined, possibly on account of the difficulty between John F. Funk and Jacob Wisler in Elkhart County.

A large number of members in the Wood County Mennonite settlement also subscribed for the *Herald* during 1865 and following years. Preacher Jacob Kaempfer, of Fostoria, took only the German paper. Most of the following took both the English and German edition: Henry Tyson, David Tyson, Daniel Tyson, John Legron, Sr., Christ. Risser, Abraham Overholt, John Stoner, Isaac Tyson, Henry Pletcher, Jacob Pletcher, Henry Risser, and Jacob Weinland. The only new names added to this list in 1866 was that of Enos Bedall, probably not a Mennonite. Beginning in 1866 Jacob Kaempfer subscribed for both editions. In 1869 George K. Tyson, John B. Tyson, and J. K. Tyson were added to the list.

The Seneca County Mennonites never used any language in their services except German. Some of the inscriptions on the gravestones, however, indicate that in spite of a brave effort to preserve the German language, they knew very little about it. Evidently whenever any writing was to be done in German, it was done by English copyists who spelled phonetically the material that was dictated to them in the German language. The following example is taken from the gravestone of Mary Allderffer:

"Here ruean dea gea bine von Mary Allderffer aena ga bornna Fryan warda ga Boran dan 28 tag July 1810 und ist ga storban den 10 tag April 1851 und Brachte ehr laban auf 40 y. 8 m., & 13 d." (Here lie the mortal remains of Mary Alderfer, nee Fry, who was born July 28, 1810, and died April 10, 1851, and brought her life to 40 y. 8 m., and 13 days.)

After services were discontinued in the Mennonite church, and especially after the church was sold in 1886, many families no longer buried their dead in the adjoining cemetery. A number of graves have been opened by friends of the deceased and both the grave and gravestone moved to the Woodlawn cemetery west of Bloomville. In Woodlawn lie George Muckley and his daughter Catherine, also others: the Rothgapes, and Sophia (1840-1896) and Eliza (1838-1906), wives of the J. F. Legrone. The remains of both Benjamin

Martin and David Martin were removed to Woodlawn from the Mennonite cemetery. Usually instead of purchasing new grave stones those that had been used in the Mennonite cemetery were removed and reset in Woodlawn.

Nearly all of the burials remaining in the Mennonite cemetery were made before 1860. However, as already mentioned, Elizabeth, wife of Christian Brand, was buried in the Mennonite cemetery in 1883, and Elizabeth, wife of Jacob Detweiler, Sr., was buried there in 1860. During the past few years the Detweiler descendants carefully reset the gravestones of their ancestors on a solid concrete base. There are three other late burials: Michael Brand, who died in 1866, Susanna Knupp, in 1871, aged fifty years; and her husband Benjamin Knopp in 1882, aged sixty. The latter sold property to J. F. Legrone in Bloomville in June, 1873. A certain Susan Knopp purchased a small lot four miles east and one mile north of the church in 1859 from A. K. Hunsicker.

As already stated, an acre plot to provide for a cemetery and for the erection of a church was deeded to the trustees of the "Manominist Church" on January 25, 1842. The deed specified that "The premises shall be free for a buryinggground for all denominations and that the meetinghouse be free to preach funerals therein." At least one burial, that of John, son of Fredrich and Mary Allderffar, who died March 5, 1841, had been made in the cemetery before the church was built.[13]

In the Mennonite cemetery, southeast of Bloomville, also lie buried Jacob Troxel, who died September, 3, 1847, and Elizabeth, his wife, who died May 12, 1854, age 74. Also Jacob, died (1880) and Magdalena, his wife, who died in 1882, aged 71. Here are also the graves of H [enry] and E [lizabeth] Troxel's two sons who died in 1838 and 1856. Eliza, the wife of Andrew Bachtel, who died in 1862 is buried in this cemetery. So also are the following: Magdalene, wife of John Myers, who died in 1857 leaving her husband with a baby four days old which died fifty days later; Elizabeth, wife of C. Oberholzer (1800-1858). The burials also include members

[13] It would be more nearly accurate to say "before the property was deeded to the congregation." It is possible, even probable, that the meetinghouse was built on George Muckley's land some time before, and that when his health failed he deeded the property to the congregation in order to avoid legal complications after his death. It was not uncommon on the frontier for a generous-spirited Mennonite brother to build a meetinghouse on his own land for the use of his fellow church members and then, years later, deed the property to the ministers.

of the Kuntz and Hossler families. Some of the latter probably were Mennonites.

It seems no longer possible to determine who the early ministers were but it was the custom in some Mennonite congregations to deed the church to the ministers and deacon. If this would be true in the case of the Seneca County congregation, the ministers at the time the church was built were Henry Troxel, Jacob Rothgape, and Isaac Rohrer. The obituary of a certain Henry Troxel, who died in 1869 in his fifty-ninth year, makes reference to his having been a minister. He had been a member of the Mennonite Church for thirty years and died of typhoid fever. A Henry Troxel was either the executor or the administrator of the estate of Jacob Troxel who died in Wood County in 1847.

During the later years of the history of the church in Seneca County, Isaac Rohrer was the only minister. Near the close of his life, apparently about 1879, he and his wife moved to Mahoning County, Ohio, where the wife, Magdalene (Troxel) Muckley, died very suddenly on December 17, 1894, at the age of eighty-six and was buried from the Midway Meetinghouse. The services were in charge of Abraham Brubaker and Isaac Good of Medina County, ministers in the Old Order (Wisler) Mennonite Church.

Isaac Rohrer prospered financially in Seneca. At one time he owned almost an entire section of land. When he sold this and moved to Bloomville, he bought a tract of land northeast of Bloomville where the Frantz Stone Quarry is now located. He died in Mahoning County and was buried there.

Although the meetinghouse was moved away in 1886, the six large stones which served as a foundation for the twenty-four by thirty-foot building still mark the spot where it stood. A medium-size sycamore tree now stands in the middle of the former site of the church. In 1942 when the writer visited the spot, George Detweiler gave a vivid description of the building and its furnishings. The meetinghouse was built of hewn logs. The seats in the front part (north end) of the church were arranged lengthwise facing the pulpit. These seats had backs. The benches running across the rear of the building had no backs. All the seats were made of poplar lumber. There was no platform; but a high pulpit desk, probably twelve feet long, extended across the church in front of the preachers' bench. These were the usual furnishings and arrangement of the frontier Mennonite churches.

The congregation seems never to have had a resident bishop. In the early years Henry Stemen, of Fairfield County, later of Allen County, had bishop oversight of the congregation. Later he ordained George Brenneman, of Putnam County, bishop, and somewhat later he seems to have invited John M. Brenneman, whom he had ordained bishop in Franklin County, to move to Allen County. After that time John M. Brenneman served as bishop over most of the northwestern Ohio congregations. Isaac Hoffer was the bishop of the Williams County congregation. John Thut, bishop of the Riley Creek Mennonite congregation west of Bluffton, also assisted with the bishop oversight of some of the churches to the time of his death in 1868.

Little is known of the later history of the Seneca County congregation. In 1868 Bishop John M. Brenneman reported in the *Herald of Truth* that he had visited with Preacher Isaac Rohrer sixteen miles north of Bucyrus where there was "but a small flock of fellow believers." He states that he had stopped two miles north of Bucyrus with the Gerhardts "where two of our sisters resided," and that on July 2-4 they held meetings at the church two miles north of the Isaac Rohrer home. He held a meeting, evidently an examination meeting, on Saturday afternoon, and communion services on Sunday morning.[14] Brenneman reported that the members lived very peaceably with each other and he pleaded that ministers should visit the little flock and directed them to notify Isaac Rohrer at Bloomville, Seneca County, of the time of their arrival.[15]

The congregation was always extremely conservative. All the services were conducted in German and the congregation would not permit the organization of a Sunday school. After the difficulty in Elkhart County, Indiana, which resulted in the organization of the Old Order (Wisler) Mennonite group, the Seneca Congregation as well as most of the other Mennonite congregations in northern Ohio followed Bishop Jacob Wisler and Bishop Abraham Rohrer,

[14] John M. Brenneman also mentions conducting "meeting at a small Methodist meetinghouse in the neighborhood." This probably indicates that descendents of Mennonite families worshiped at that church.

[15] This may have been Bishop John M. Brenneman's last ministry to this congregation. Shortly after this date he called John F. Funk to Elida to organize a Sunday school at the Salem meetinghouse. Soon after that the "Funks" and "Wislers" had little to do with each other. And Preacher Isaac Rohrer followed the example of his brother, Bishop Abraham Rohrer, of Medina County, in attempting to preserve the "old order" of a German preaching service on Sunday morning with no Sunday school and no evening service.

of Medina County. Soon after this time some of the members united with the Reformed Church.[16]

Since the last service was held in the church in 1879, this may be the date of Isaac Rohrer's removal to Mahoning County. The building was sold to Paul Miller, of Bloomville, in 1886. At that time the woodburning stove was still in the church and tramps had begun to make the old building their rendezvous so that it became a nuisance and a menace to the peace of the community. After Paul Miller bought the house he removed the benches made of wide clear poplar plank. The money received from the sale of the church building was used to build a fence around the cemetery. This fence is now (1942) in a bad state of repair. Miller resold the building to M. F. Hossler, who razed it and built a house out of it in Bloomville. The meetinghouse had been built of hewn logs and was sided with lumber on the outside and ceiled on the inside. The logs, after more than forty years' use, were still in good condition and made excellent stringers.

There is little evidence that the members of the small Mennonite settlement in Bloom Township made much of an impression on their neighbors. The settlement was too small and the members too widely scattered to foster a strong group spirit. Their refusal to accommodate themselves to their changing surroundings, especially with regard to the introduction of the English language into their services and the organization of a Sunday school, dispersed the membership. Those who held more firmly to the Mennonite faith were willing to undergo the expense and inconvenience of removal to stronger Mennonite communities, chiefly in Medina, western Wayne, or Mahoning counties, Ohio. A diluted Mennonitism and social ties of various sorts, the natural result of a small scattered membership, made a transfer of church membership to other churches easy or even preferable or left the descendants of Mennonite families stranded without a church home. Their few descendants remaining in the community are, as a rule, active members of the Reformed or Methodist churches. These scattered remnants bearing Mennonite names, and the lonely little cemetery southeast of Bloomville, are all that remain of a once promising Mennonite congregation.

16 The transition to the Reformed Church was not difficult for Mennonites. Both groups were German, and even before leaving Germany, members of the same family apparently might be found in both churches. All of the third generation Muckleys were members of the Reformed Church.

NOTE

Correction on the Wood County History.

(published in the REVIEW of April 1944)

George J. Tyson, Box 85, Lemon Cove, California, after reading over the history of the extinct Wood County Mennonite Church in the April issue (1944) of the MENNONITE QUARTERLY REVIEW, makes the following corrections: Near the bottom of page 90 the statement that Mrs. Veronica Boyer was a cousin of William S. Tyson should read "an aunt of William S. Tyson." On page 96, in the middle of the page, there is an error regarding David K. Tyson's purchase of a sawmill, eighty rods west of the church. This error is corrected on page 115, second paragraph. George J. Tyson also states that Rebecca Boyer married Jacob Culp instead of Isaac Culp as stated near the bottom of page 103. He further states that he finds only these "minor errors" in the article. J. U.

IV. Crawford and Richland Counties, near Galion

While collecting material on the history of the Seneca and Ashland County Mennonite congregations the writer discovered in the vicinity of Galion, Ohio, another small Mennonite settlement closely related to other Northern Ohio Mennonite congregations by ties of friendship and kinship. This settlement extended eastward from a few miles west of Galion in Crawford County to beyond Ontario in Ashland County. Apparently it lay in a northeast-southwest direction for a little over ten miles roughly along what is now U.S. Route 30 South.

This settlement is important because it is another link in the westward movement of population during the nineteenth century when sheer physical strength and industry subdued the forest wilderness and made it capable of supporting a great civilized population. This westward movement as a whole, especially as it relates to Mennonites, has not yet been fully explored by the church historian. The settlement has further significance as furnishing one of the few examples of a frontier union church in which Mennonites had an interest.[1]

[1] Union meetinghouses were not uncommon on the frontier. Reformed and Lutheran congregations built a number of such churches in early Ohio towns. That in Wooster, Ohio, is an example. Mennonites, however, usually erected their own meet-

Probably the first Mennonite settler was Samuel Pletcher who left Lancaster County, Pa., in 1819, remained in Ashland County one year to raise a crop of wheat because, being well on in years, he could not eat corn bread, and finally located in the Crawford County woods west of Galion in 1820. He died on March 15, 1830, at the age of seventy-nine and was buried on his own farm in the family burying ground now know as the Pletcher cemetery lying about two and one-half miles west of Galion.

Samuel Pletcher's children were: Elizabeth (married on May 17, 1835, Peter Imhof, a German immigrant, later a Mennonite bishop in Ashland County); Catherine (married Michael Kilmer who after his wife's death in 1852 moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, and finally to Kansas); Mary (Molly, married Andrew Hibschmann); Samuel (married a Nesiterode [Nesselrodt?]); Henry (married Barbara Seiler); and Jacob[2] (married Barbara Null.[3] Discovery of this group of Mennonites in southeastern Crawford County and western Richland raised the question whether there might not have been a small congregation at this place during the eighteen-thirties and forties. They were too far from the Muckley Mennonite Meetinghouse in Bloom Township, Seneca County, as well as from the Brubacher Meetinghouse in Mifflin Township, Ashland County, to worship regularly at either of those places.[4] It seemed likely that they conducted services in the homes

inghouse, sometimes specifying in the deed that it should be open to everyone for funeral services but that other denominations could hold common preaching services only by special permission of the trustees. A union meetinghouse in which Mennonites, Amish, and others held joint ownership was built in Tuscarawas County at Union Hill. (See John Umble, *Ohio Mennonite Sunday Schools,* 281.) Another such building was erected by Mennonites and others about five miles south of Ashland, Ohio, about 1834. So far as the writer knows no permanent Old Mennonite congregation resulted from any such union movement in Ohio. The General Conference Mennonite congregation at Sugar Creek, Ohio, originally was a union movement among Old Mennonites, Dunkards, and others. (See Umble, *op. cit.,* 340-43.)

[2] The brothers, Henry and Jacob Pletcher, are mentioned in the Wood County history as the fathers of Jacob Pletcher and Elizabeth Pletcher, first cousins, who were married in 1833, and moved to Wood County from Richland County after 1841. See *The Mennonite Quarterly Review,* XVIII (April, 1944), 96.

[3] It is possible that Null is a corrupted spelling of Nold which in some early manuscripts seems to be spelled Noll. (See H. S. Bender, *Mennonite Historical Bulletin,* V (September, 1944, 1.) The name Null, however, is a Mennonite name found both in Elkhart County, Indiana, and in Pennsylvania. A certain Mary Freed born in Richland County, Ohio, on March 24, 1835, married Christian Null on March 20, 1856. She united with the Mennonite Church after moving to Indiana.

[4] The members of the Mennonite group near Galion lived from twenty to thirty miles from either of these meetinghouses. The Brubacher Meetinghouse in western Ashland County was several miles south of Paradise Hill.

of members or that they had a meetinghouse. Further research shows that Joseph Freed, of Ontario, Richland County, was their minister from approximately 1840 until his death in 1872, that they had no meetinghouse of their own and that they sometimes held services in the homes of members, but that they met for services also in a union meetinghouse near Ontario, about six miles west of Mansfield.

As stated above, Samuel Pletcher and his sons and sons-in-law seem to have been the first Mennonite settlers west of Galion. Jacob and Barbary (*sic*) Pletcher sold fifty acres about two and a half miles west of Galion to David Reed in 1827. The purchase price, $62.50, was paid by Samuel Pletcher. This David Reed (1783-1844) is buried in the Pletcher cemetery west of Galion. Besides him is buried his wife (1786-1850). In November, 1841, Jacob A. Pletcher and wife Ann sold forty acres for $325.00 to John Kilmore (Kilmer) about a mile southeast of David Reed's 1827 purchase. They had paid $222.00 for this tract in March of the same year. When Kilmer moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, in 1849, he sold the same tract to Henry Pletcher for $1,000.00

Burials in the Pletcher family cemetery two and one-half miles west of Galion in Crawford County, Ohio, indicate that the Mennonite settlement persisted until after 1860. In addition to the pioneer Samuel Pletcher mentioned above, the burials made there include the following: Jacob N. Pletcher, died July 22, 1866, aged 46; his wife, Suzanna, on April 9, 1893, aged 67; Suzanna Cathcart, on August 18, 1849, at the age of 33; her daughter, aged one month, twenty-three days, on August 16, 1849; Esther Shenk, on December 5, 1852, aged 73; Jacob A. Pletcher, on July 28, 1853, at the age of 65; his wife on March 31, 1853, aged 67; David Reed (already mentioned) on August 12, 1844, aged 61; Reed's wife, on June 26, 1856, aged 70. All of these are buried in the Pletcher cemetery.

In July, 1866, Jacob N. Pletcher, mentioned above, who was then living in Crawford County, was making hay. His team ran off on July 15 and a load of hay passed over his body. As a result of this accident he died on July 22 and was buried the next day. Services were conducted by Preacher Joseph Freed of Crawford County, and Bishop John M. Brenneman. Joseph Freed was the shepherd of the Crawford-Richland County flock. Preacher Joseph

Freed's widow, Hannah Snyder, a number of years after the incident here mentioned, was referred to by Bishop John M. Brenneman as "Sister Freed." The Freeds originally moved from Bucks County, Pennsylvania, to Rockingham County, Virginia; later to Fayette County, Pennsylvania, and Holmes and Stark County, Ohio. A number of their descendants live in Elkhart County, Indiana.

Several Kilmers are buried in the Pletcher cemetery. Faney (*sic*) Kilmer died May 14, 1850; Catharine, died March 15, 1852, aged 34 (this was Catharine Pletcher, mentioned above, the wife of Michael Kilmer, who later moved to Kansas); Elizabeth, infant daughter of P(hilip?) and C(atharine?) Kilmer. A much later burial in the cemetery is that of Henry W. Pletcher who was born in 1853 and died in 1933. He seems not to have been a Mennonite. A decorated iron pyramid more than five feet high marks his grave. Three children named Beltz are buried here. They died in 1856, 1861, and 1864.

Before settling in the vicinity of Galion in the late thirties and early forties the Kilmers had lived in Ashland County, Ohio, at least as early as 1835. Prior to that time Juniata County, Pennsylvania, had been the home of two brothers, Isaac and John Kilmer. Isaac and his sons all seem to have moved to Ashland and later to Crawford County. It is not clear whether John Kilmer, the brother of Isaac ever lived in Ashland County, but his wife, Magdalene, who died March 5, 1848, at the age of sixty-eight, is buried in the Pleasant Ridge Cemetery in that county. Ann,[5] the daughter of John and Magdalene Kilmer, married her first cousin, Isaac S., a son of Isaac and Eve (Shelley) Kilmer. Michael Kilmer, mentioned above as the son-in-law of the pioneer Samuel Pletcher also was a son of John and Magdalene Kilmer.

Isaac Kilmer, mentioned above, was a native of Germany, and lived for a time at Mifflintown, Pennsylvania. He died near Galion, Ohio, April 13, 1845, at the age of fifty-seven, and as stated above, is buried in the Pletcher cemetery. His wife was Eve Shelley (1781-1860), who moved to Indiana with some of her children after her husband's death and died there. Isaac and Eve Kilmer

[5] Anna Kilmer, wife of Isaac S. Kilmer, was born in Juniata County, Pennsylvania, on June 14, 1810, and married Isaac S. Kilmer in Ashland County, Ohio, in 1839, where they resided thirteen years (until 1852). She died in Elkhart County, Indiana, on January 23, 1892, at the home of her daughter Sarah who was the wife of the Mennonite deacon, Jacob H. Wisler. Anna Kilmer was a first cousin to her husband, Isaac Kilmer.

were the parents of four sons: Philip S.,[6] (1808-1886) married in 1838 to Catherine Martin, daughter of Christian and Anna Martin of Pennsylvania; John S., (1809-1862) married Catherine (Ramer) Kilmer (1812-1873), Isaac S., referred to above, (1814-1882; Samuel S., who in 1842 married Catherine Boyer (1824-1913), and died in 1866.

The gravestones in the Pleasant Ridge Cemetery in Vermillion Township, Ashland County, show that these and other Kilmer families were living in Ashland County from 1835 to 1848. Two infants less than two years old, Eve and Isaac, the children of J (ohn?) and C(atherine?) Kilmer, were buried in this cemetery in 1835 and 1838 respectively. Isaac, son of P(hilip?) and C(atherine?) Kilmer, died in 1840 at the age of five. Thomas J. and William H., who died in 1845, aged, respectively, two years and four months, were the infants of P. and J. Kilmer, apparently of a different family. This P. Kilmer may have been a son of John and Magdalene mentioned above and possibly a brother of Michael and Ann. All of the surviving sons of the elder Isaac Kilmer moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, but some of them had lived a number of years in western Richland or eastern Crawford in the vicinity of Galion before moving to Indiana.

Some of the Kilmer families began moving into Crawford County from Ashland County before 1840. As stated above John Kilmer purchased forty acres for $325 from Jacob A. Pletcher in 1841. He was already living in Crawford County when he made this purchase. John Kilmer and his wife sold this land to Henry Pletcher in 1839 for $400 and the next year twenty acres more for $200. Philip Kilmer in 1840 purchased forty acres for $650.

It is possible that one of the Kilmers mentioned above was a bishop who had formerly been in charge of the Ashland County Mennonite Church. In 1841 Preacher John Risser, of Ashland County, wrote to friends in Clarence Center, New York, that Bishop Kilmer had moved away from Ashland County.[7] It is possible that this Bishop Kilmer was the Isaac Kilmer who died on

[6] Following the custom still observed by some Amish and Mennonite families Isaac Kilmer gave to each of his sons as a middle initial, the first letter of the maiden name of his wife, Eve Shelley.

[7] According to the correspondence referred to in *The Mennonite Quarterly Review,* VI (April, 1932), 119, Bishop Nold of the Columbiana-Mahoning district served the congregation in 1837 and Bishop Kilmer (*Volle Diener*) had moved away before 1841.

April 13, 1845, at the age of fifty-seven, and was buried in the Pletcher cemetery west of Galion.

When Catherine Pletcher, wife of Michael Kilmer, died in 1852, she left the following orphaned children, probably born in the Crawford-Richland Mennonite settlement: Daniel (1842-1917), Magdalene, Margaret (aged five), Mrs. Reuben Heatwole, and Emma (Anna K. Holderman?). Soon after his wife's death, Michael Kilmer moved to Elkhart County, Indiana. His daughter, Margaret worked by the year in the vicinity of Wakarusa for "Mam" Ramer and for Tobias Hartmans. Her daughter, Mrs. C. D. Yoder, of Windom, Kansas, states that Margaret Kilmer was the first single Mennonite woman to move to Kansas. She was really a pioneer and very much alive to the interests of the church. This daughter ascribes to her mother's missionary spirit the zeal for missions evidenced by the latter's grandchildren.[8]

After living in Elkhart County for a number of years, Michael Kilmer moved to Kansas, apparently in June, 1872. He writes to friends in Indiana that he wishes more Mennonite people would move there so that they could organize a Sunday school. He continues that he has been thinking of starting Sunday school, if the neighbors are interested and if it is possible to secure suitable books. R. J. Heatwole, Kilmer's son-in-law, visits him a few months later and states that Michael Kilmer is superintendent of a Sunday school, with an attendance of twenty-five to forty. Kilmer's address was Newton, Harvey County, Kansas.[9]

In 1886 Reuben J. Heatwole, whose wife, Margaret Kilmer, had been born in the Crawford-Richland Mennonite settlement, decided to make an extended visit to points in Ohio where his wife's relatives lived and to Virginia, Reuben Heatwole's early home. They left Harvey County, Kansas, on September 4, 1886, and drove to Elkhart, Indiana, in a spring wagon, visiting relatives and friends in Missouri, Iowa, and Illinois. They left their team in Elkhart County on January 11 and took the train for Harrison-

[8] Reuben J. Heatwole, of Marion County, Kansas, and Margaret Kilmer, of McPherson County, were married on February 27, 1873, by Bishop Henry Yother, of Blue Springs, Nebraska. They were the parents of Lydia Heatwole, R.N., first supervisor of nurses at the Mennonite Hospital at La Junta, Colorado, and grandparents of Phebe Yoder, missionary to Africa, and Calvin Holderman, missionary to Argentina.

[9] Considerable interest was aroused about this time (1872) in Mennonite colonization in Kansas. Preacher Daniel Brenneman, of the Yellow Creek Congregation, had promised to move to Marion Center, Kansas, by October, but he wrote that he was unable to go because he could not find a buyer for his property in Indiana.

burg, Virginia. Stopping enroute at Mansfield, Ohio, they visited Mrs. Heatwole's relatives, the Imhoffs, Beglies (Joshua and Anna Imhoff Begly), and Lehmans, (John W. and Mary Imhoff Lehman), some of whom lived in Wayne County. Mrs. Heatwole's aunt, Elizabeth (Pletcher) Imhoff (1813-1886), wife of Bishop Peter Imhoff (1806-1893), had died a few days before they arrived. On January 18, their cousins, Christian Imhoff (1853-1942), and Henry Imhoff (1846-1918) and wife (Susanna Burk) took them eleven miles to Mansfield where they departed for Harrisonburg, Virginia. On the return trip in June, they again visited the Imhoff and Pletcher relatives in Wayne and Ashland Counties, and the family of another relative, Adam Martin, in Crawford County.

As stated above all the sons of the elder Isaac Kilmer moved to Elkhart County.[10] Philip S. Kilmer moved to Baugo Township,

[10] A considerable number of Mennonite families in Northern Ohio Mennonite settlements moved to Elkhart County between 1840 and 1860. From fourteen members in 1842 the number of Mennonites in the western part of that county grew to hundreds within the next twenty years. The reasons for this sudden influx are still not too clearly understood. The route, overland by wagon, usually avoided the marshy lands of Steuben County and turned north across the Michigan line from Northwestern Ohio then through Bronson County, Michigan, past Coldwater, White Pigeon, Mottville, and Bristol to Elkhart and Wakarusa. Some of the Indiana settlers, however, in moving from Ohio completed the second stage of the journey from a point in Ohio by way of the Ft. Wayne branch of the Ohio-Lake Erie Canal running from Cincinnati to Toledo. Some actually settled at South Whitley in Whitley County, Indiana, for a year or more before completing the third stage of the journey to Elkhart County. Below is a partial list of settlers who came to Elkhart County from the east. Practically all of those who arrived before 1850 and some of those who came much later lived in log houses. Many of them were obliged to cut down and remove trees before they could find a clear space to erect a dwelling. Many of the earlier non-Mennonites were Dunkards. Most of the early Amish settlers moved to Lagrange County.

Non-Mennonites

John McKibbin—early
Solomon Mikael—1828
Peter Livengood—1828
John S. Cripe—1829
Jacob Cripe and family—1829
Daniel Cripe, first Dunkard Pre.—1830
Jones, St. Joe. Co.—1830
Moses Sailor—1832
Frederick Whittig—1832
Cornell—1833
Peter Fetters, Jr.—1833
Elias Manning—1834
John Larimer—1835
Martin Stuckman—1836
Cook (to Goshen)—1836
John Burkholder—1836
Christopher Strycker—1836
Benjamin Zigler—1838
John Hauenstein—1838
Samuel Ulery—1838
Jonathan Myers—1838
Samuel Ritter—1843 Menn.?
Dinehart—1844
Christian Nusbaum and family—1848. Menn.?
Jacob and Lydia Mell—1848. Amish?
Jacob Deahl—1850
John Paul Michael—1854
John H. Cramer, Lagrange—1855
Joseph Miller, Sr.—1864

Mennonites

George Culp—early
Dea. Daniel Freed—early
Jacob Ramer—early
Joseph Noffsinger and family—1827
Parents of Barbara (Landis) Davidhizar—about 1830
Abraham Hoover and family—1832
Daniel B. Stutzman and wife—1832
Elias Ehret and family—1840
Henry Smeltzer and wife—1842
John H. Whisler—1842
Jonas Schrock and wife—1844
Jacob K. Beutler—1846
Abraham Moyer and wife—1847
Jacob Whisler and wife—1847
Adam Hartman and wife—1848
Christiana (Buzzard) Holdeman and children—1848
Holdeman—after 1848
Buzzard—1849
Joseph Brubaker and wife—1849
John Wisler and family—1849
Dea. Jacob H. Wisler—1849
Benaville Good—1849
Wisler Brothers—1849
Henry J. Culp and wife—before 1850
John Schwin and wife—1840 plus
Valentine Hartman and wife—1850
John Buzzard—1850
Parents of Christian N. Holdeman—1850

Elkhart County, Indiana, in 1853. Some of his descendants living south of Jamestown are members of the Methodist Church. His son Christian served in the Union Army during the Civil War and was killed in battle. One son, known as "Big Philip" (1850-1890), married Anna Moyer (1840-1913). A granddaughter of "Big Philip" (Mary Kilmer) attended Goshen College and is now teaching in the Baugo Township schools.

John S. Kilmer (1809-1862) and his wife, Catherine (Ramer) Kilmer (1812-1873) seem to have moved from Ashland County to Crawford County west of Galion between 1838 and 1841. As stated elsewhere they were already living in Crawford County when he purchased land there in 1841. Two of their children, Eve and Isaac, died in 1835 and 1838, respectively, and are buried in the Pleasant Ridge cemetery in Vermillion Township, Ashland County. From Crawford they moved to Williams County, Ohio,[11] and from Williams County to Elkhart County, Indiana. Their son, Philip R. Kilmer,[12] was born in Crawford County on April 8, 1845. About 1874 the family moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, where for fifty years the Kilmers lived on a farm four miles southeast of Wakarusa. On December 25, 1875, Philip R. was married to Mary Ann Weaver. They were the parents of eleven children, seven boys and four girls. His wife died March 24, 1903.

When Philip R. Kilmer died on May 19, 1924, he was survived by four sons and four daughters: Philip W., Jr.,[12] of Foraker, Indiana; John, and David; and Mrs. David (Lydia) Ressler, of Medina County, Ohio; Mrs. Harvey (Emma) Martin, of

Abraham Garber—1850
Joseph D. Culp—1850
Coppes Family—1850
Peter Blosser and family—1851
The Truex's—1851
Abraham Weldy and family—1851
Pre. Jacob Freed—1851
Isaac S. Kilmer and wife—1852
Samuel S. Kilmer and wife—1852
Jacob Stauffer, Jr.—1852
Jacob Pletcher and family—1852
Jacob Stauffer and family—1852
Michael Kilmer and children—1852
Jacob and Lydia Myers—1852
Jacob Freed and wife—1852
Anthony Culp and wife—1852
Philip Kilmer—1853
Michael Weaver and family—1853
Isaac Leatherman—1853
Dr. Henry Heatwole and wife—1853
Jacob Bowman and wife—1854
Andrew and Elizabeth (Moyer) Freed—1854
Henry B. Myers and wife—1854
Benjamin H. Hoffman and wife—1854
Emanuel Fink and family—1854
William S. Bitner and family—1854
George W. Eby and wife—1857
Henry Culp—1857
David Garber—1858
Stealy Family—1858
Peter Lehman—1858
Christian Null—1860
David B. Nusbaum—1860
Jacob D. Myers and wife—1863
John Nusbaum—1860
Henry Risser and family—1864
Noah Bare—1864
Henry Wenger—1865
John J. Huffman—1865
Solomon Kauffman—1866
Gongwer—before 1882

A number of Mennonite families from Holland settled here in 1854-58, having such names as Smit, Visser, Belt, Symmensma, Hygema, Klynstra.

11 See *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, XVIII (January, 1944), 39.

12 Here again are two examples of the first letter of the mother's maiden name becoming the middle initial of the son: Philip R., (Ramer) and Philip W., (Weaver).

Wakarusa; Mrs. Mary Horning of Lancaster, Pennsylvania; Henry, of Ephrata, Lancaster County, Pennsylvania; and Mrs. Joseph (Katie) Lehman, of Nappanee.

Philip R. Kilmer was a member of the Old Order (Wisler) Mennonite Church at Yellow Creek. After his death at the Elkhart County Hospital, his body was taken to the home of his daughter, Mrs. Harvey Martin, where a short funeral service was held before the main service at the Yellow Creek Church. The funeral notice printed in the local paper stated that "the body will be taken from Wakarusa to the church in a horse-drawn hearse and there will be no automobiles in the funeral procession." A few of the relatives drove to the church from the house in automobiles but by a different route. A granddaughter of Philip R. Kilmer, Anna Mabel Kilmer, of near Foraker, attended Goshen College and is teaching in Harrison Township.

Isaac S. Kilmer (1814-1882) also moved to Elkhart County. He seems to have been a minister or at least was very prominent in church work. In 1866 he accompanied Bishop John M. Brenneman and Preachers Daniel Brenneman and William Moyer to St. Joseph County, Michigan, on a visit to the Mennonite congregation at that place. In 1871 he accompanied Preachers Michael Shank and Daniel Brenneman to Canada where they spent three weeks holding meetings. In writing of this evangelistic tour, Daniel Brenneman states that he had solicited and gained the consent of "Brother Isaac Kilmer" to accompany him. There is nothing in any of the articles to indicate that Kilmer actually preached.

Samuel S. Kilmer moved to Crawford from Ashland in 1842 soon after his marriage to Catherine, daughter of George and Sarah Boyer, who was born in Butler County, Pennsylvania, January 4, 1824, moved to Ashland County, Ohio, with her parents in 1839. In the spring of 1852 Samuel S. Kilmer and his wife drove to Indiana and settled in Section One of Locke Township, Elkhart County. Here Samuel Kilmer died in 1866.[18] At his wife's death in 1913 two sons survived her: Philip D. and John H. Kilmer, both of Wakarusa. She also had one brother and one sister living in

[18] During the year following Samuel S. Kilmer's death (in 1867) his widow married the widower John Freed whose wife also had died in 1866. Freed was born in Holmes County, Ohio, in 1824 and married Catharine Newcomer in 1845. Jacob Freed, father of John, moved from Paint Township, Holmes County, to Locke Township, Elkhart County, Indiana, in 1852 with his family, eighteen persons in all, and moved into a round-log cabin.

Ashland, Ohio. She had been a member of the Mennonite Church from her youth.

Philip D. (1854-1927) whose wife's name was Barbara (1856-1924), lived near Wakarusa. He was known as "Little Philip" and died without issue. John H. was a member of the Christian Church in Wakarusa.

Practically nothing is known of the early history of the Crawford-Richland congregation beyond the names of the settlers as they are revealed in the family records and on the tombstones in the cemeteries. Most of these names have been mentioned above: the sons and sons-in-law of Samuel Pletcher, the pioneer; the elder Isaac Kilmer and his sons; and David Reed who may have been a brother-in-law or other relative of Samuel Pletcher. It is not known whether or not the families of the wives or husbands of Samuel Pletcher's children lived in the settlement—the Nesiterodes, Hibschmans, Seilers and Nulls (Nolds?). However in 1854 after Michael Kilmer moved to Elkhart County he granted to a certain Andrew Hibschman of Richland County, Ohio, power of attorney to transact certain business for him and for his orphaned children. A certain Elkhart County Stauffer family, possibly Jacob Stauffer, lived near Galion before 1850.

Strangely enough one of the few contemporary non-Mennonite references to Mennonite life and preaching is specific mention of the Crawford County congregation. This reference is found on page seventy of a book entitled *Die Lebenserfahrungen von Joh. Schneider, sen* (The Memoirs of John Schneider, senior.) This book was published in Cincinnati in 1860 by the Rev. P. F. Schneider, a Methodist preacher.[14] John Schneider had settled near Galion, Crawford County, in 1834. He writes (translated): "Most of our neighbors were Pennsylvania Germans and were very helpful to us in everything, so that we felt quite at home among them. They were Mennonites and I often visited their regular church services in the neighborhood. I found among them many very good Christians who, as I believe, took seriously the matter of working out their soul's salvation. In particular I became acquainted with several of their preachers who came from a distance from time to time and under whose preaching I was much edified."

The last sentence might mean that in 1834 the congregation

[14] *Herold der Wahrheit*, XXX (October 15, 1893), 306.

had no resident minister. The "preachers who came from a distance" undoubtedly included Samuel Pletcher's son-in-law, Peter Imhoff, of Ashland County, and Bishop Jacob Nold, of Columbiana; probably also Bishop Henry Stemen, of Fairfield County, and Jacob Beutler, of Ashland County. The names of the first resident ministers apparently are lost.

Little is known of the later years of the Crawford-Richland Mennonite congregation. A letter written by Preacher Daniel Brenneman, of Elkhart County, Indiana, and printed in the *Herald of Truth* (1865), gives a few details about the location of the home of Preacher Joseph Freed. Brenneman states that he and D. H. Landis, one of the Mennonite preachers driven out of the Shenandoah Valley of Virginia during the Civil War, walked eight miles from Galion to the home of Preacher Joseph Freed where they spent the night.

Daniel Brenneman again visited at Galion in 1871, probably in November. He and Benjamin Hoover of Fairfield County, Ohio, stopped at Galion on the way to Lima. Brenneman, in writing of this trip, says that they were met at the station "by Brother Bitner." They conducted services at the Bitner home in the evening and after the meeting they "went home with Brother Freed." The next morning they took the train at Crestline and proceeded to Lima.[15]

Early the next year (February 5, 1872), Preacher Joseph Freed died at the age of sixty-five. He had been a minister about thirty years. His obituary printed in the*Herald of Truth* states that "in his removal the little flock over which he has, for many years, been

[15] Another interesting example of pastoral work done by the Brenneman brothers and one which is connected with the history of the Wood County Church in the April issue of the *Mennonite Quarterly Review* is the visit of Bishop George Brenneman of Putnam County to Wood County in June, 1866. Brenneman conducted the preparatory service and the communion service, besides doing other pastoral work. He mentions Brother Leckron (sic) and writes that he gave communion to "Brother Jackson" (probably Jackson Cupp), who was afflicted with shaking palsy. If Bishop George Brenneman actually gave communion to Jackson Cupp, who must have been a member of the Methodist Church, it is an interesting sidelight on the pastoral work of visiting Mennonite bishops during this period. In addition to holding preparatory services on one day and communion services on Sunday, Brenneman also conducted an ordination service, ordaining Henry Pletcher deacon on June 9. Evidently, then, Henry Pletcher had been ordained deacon before being ordained minister. (See Wood County History in *The Mennonite Quarterly Review,* XVIII (April, 1944), 110.) At four o'clock on Sunday, the congregation met again to receive two young people into the church. In writing of this visit Brenneman states that after the last service he went home with Brother A. Bechtel, who lived twelve miles away.

keeping watch, will feel heavily the loss they now sustain." At his death he was survived by his widow and ten children. On the day following his death, however, his daughter, Elizabeth, who was married to Deacon John Nussbaum (born in Ashland County, Ohio, in 1832) and was living in Elkhart County, Indiana, died. She had been married on October 25, 1852, in Richland County, Ohio, and had moved to Indiana in 1860. Another daughter, Rosa, died in Richland County of tuberculosis on November 11 of the same year.

Preacher Freed's postoffice address was Ontario. This also was the postoffice address of Samuel M. Pletcher, probably a son of Samuel Pletcher, the pioneer. Samuel M. Pletcher's death occurred three weeks after that of Preacher Joseph Freed. He had been a faithful reader of the *Herald of Truth* for many years. In fact, his name appeared among the subscribers every year, beginning in 1865. His obituary notice states that the service was preached by J. McFarland, evidently also at the Union Church near Ontario. He was survived by eight children. His wife had died ten years earlier.

John J. Weaver of Scott, LaGrange County, Indiana, visited the Crawford-Richland County Mennonite community for a week in the same year. He arrived at Crestline on October 16 where he visited "an aunt and a brother." On Sunday he preached at the Union Church. In writing of his trip he states that he had left the place fourteen years before (1858). During the visit he spent some time with an aged friend, William Flower. He stated also that he spent an evening with the aged brother, John Buckwalter. He visited "Sister Freed," whose daughter (Rosa) was very sick with tuberculosis. He also refers to a Brother and Sister David Ridner (possibly Bitner). He mentions an Isaac Freed who took him to the depot at Crestline. The father and mother of Isaac Freed were past three score years old. They and two sisters (members of the Mennonite Church) were living in Henry County where there was no Mennonite church, but they desired Mennonite preachers to stop with them.

With the death of Preacher Joseph Freed, the life of the congregation seems to have come to an end. His widow continued to reside in the community with her children until her death. The funeral services were conducted by Bishop John M. Brenneman of Allen County.

Some of the descendants of the members of this Crawford-

Richland congregation moved to Elkhart County, Indiana, as already indicated. A few returned to Medina and Wayne County, but the majority seem to have left the church of their forefathers and to have united with other denominations. If the history of the Crawford-Richland congregation points any lessons for future colonizers or founders of Mennonite congregations, they might be that a small colony widely scattered cannot build a homogeneous culture or a satisfactory congregational life and that, whenever a union effort is necessary to erect a church building, secularization is likely to swallow up the Mennonite testimony.

BOOK REVIEWS

The Hutterites: A Study in Social Cohesion. By Lee Emerson Deets. Gettysburg, Pennsylvania: The Author. 1939. Pp. 63.

This monograph is an abstract of a Ph.D. thesis written at Columbia University. The author did his graduate study under Robert S. Lynd and R. M. MacIver, two of the country's outstanding social anthropologists. Beside this Deets is an authority on the subject of American utopian communities, having read three papers on this subject before sections of the American Sociological Society. Formerly head of the Sociology Department at the South Dakota State University, Deets is now professor of sociology at Hunter College in New York City.

This study of the Hutterites is a first class piece of sociological research. Its distinctive value is the profound insight it reveals of the inner life and meaning of the beliefs and customs of the Hutterian Brethren. This is in welcome relief and refreshing contrast to many of the existing histories and popular accounts of the externally unique customs of the group.

Deets is primarily interested in discovering what has held this religious body together for four centuries, two centuries longer than any other existing communal group. In the reviewer's mind the author answers his basic question in a clear and convincing way. While he discusses the physical environment and pattern of organization, by far the most valuable section of the monograph is that dealing with the central beliefs of the Hutterian Brethren.

It is in these central beliefs that Deets finds the explanation for the group's cohesion. The central beliefs are four in number: (1) That their way of living is sanctioned by omniscient Deity who must be obeyed even to martyrdom; (2) that it is the will of Deity that they live communally; (3) that it is the will of Deity that they practice nonresistance; and (4) that they must live simply, in nonconformity to the world, in it but not of it. All of the Hutterite life is centered round these beliefs and all activity is changed in the light of them.

When members of the group are asked why they do as they do, the inevitable answer is that it is "Die Glauben." The central beliefs are looked upon as traditional, persistently constant, and absolute. They are an unchanging heritage possessed from the beginning. The *Great Chronicle* is an authoritative source as to their nature. The central beliefs are the most constant factors around which the long social movement is ordered. They serve as a frame of reference and each situation is defined in the light of them. All change is tested for consistency with the central beliefs. Thus they have developed and maintained an internally consistent and highly unified order.

A few of the more significant observations that this study brings to light are, that the Hutterites are organized around an ideology rather than a personality as has been the case in most other religious communal groups. This fact in part accounts for the group's on-going and stable nature. The ideology is preserved in the highly revered *Chronicle* (the *Chronicle* is in

possession of Rev. Michael Waldner of the Bon Homme Brotherhood in South Dakota) which contains the record of the group's major experiences since 1517. In many ways the *Chronicle* is for the Hutterites what the Talmud is for the Jews.

Because the central beliefs are supernaturally sanctioned they are absolute and unquestioned. This absolute certainty of the rightness of their beliefs makes for cohesion, and cohesion makes for security. For members to question this "rightness" is viewed by the group as sin. The Hutterite way of life produces and promotes an authority-centered mentality. From childhood the Hutterite is spared the necessity of thinking for himself, in fact, is discouraged from doing any critical thinking. He thus comes to accept direction and discipline without criticism or without fear of what the worldling would call regimentation. Religious services are formal, and correct social behavior is stressed much more than practice of personal worship. The individual conscience is a group product. It is the result of surrendering the individual will to the group will. This result is obtained through the educational system.

There are two points at which the reviewer would raise questions about statements of the author. At one point he states that the Hutterite system "came into being as a means of escape from tensions during the revolutionary period known as the Protestant Reformation." This generalization is unsupported by any evidence of any kind. Actually, the Hutterite system during the Reformation invited tensions rather than provided escape from them. Unfriendly critics of religion might say that all religious groups offer a way of escape from tension. A second point in question is the statement by the author that the Hutterites apply the concept of "secular" only to the outside world and not to any phase of life within their system. This seems to imply a misunderstanding of the very nature of the Hutterite philosophy of religion. The Hutterites, as well as the Mennonites and certain other religious groups, believe that the whole of life is sacred. Their concept of the church is that of a body of reborn men in Christ. To admit that part of the life of the group is secular would be to deny the very concept of the body of believers. That which is not sacred within the brotherhood is sinful, but not secular.

Anyone who wants to understand the structure and philosophy of the Hutterian Brethren must familiarize himself with Deets' study. It is to be highly recommended.

Bethel College J. Winfield Fretz.

Who's Who Among the Mennonites. Edited by A. WARKENTIN, assisted by MELVIN GINGERICH, Bethel College, North Newton, Kansas: A. Warkentin. 1943. Pp. 428. $2.00.

This is a revision and an enlargement of a first edition edited by A. Warkentin and published by him in 1937. The information has been brought up to date except in cases where revised data could not be secured, and the number of entries has been increased from about five hundred to approximately one thousand. An attempt has been made to enter here representative men and women in the various branches of the Mennonite Church who have made significant contributions to their churches and com-

munities. The representation is much more adequate than in the first edition, and there are now probably few important omissions. The editor of the first edition expressed the hope that readers would co-operate in making a future edition more complete. This hope in a large part has been realized.

The book contains a vast amount of information concerning contemporary Mennonites. As a reference work it is invaluable to all those who are interested in Mennonite affairs. Addresses, dates, positions, publications, and past history of Mennonite leaders are here available. As a source book for Mennonite historians the work will also be very valuable in future years. It is probable that this work will make such a place for itself as will demand new editions every five or six years.

The editors recognize that there is much room for improvement. There are, as is to be expected, some errors of fact. D. D. Miller is listed as the present treasurer of the Mennonite Board of Missions and Charities, although the entry for E. C. Bender reveals that he holds this office. Listed among the publications of J. B. Smith is *Verse by Verse Commentary on Revelation*. The publication date is given as 1943. So far as this reviewer is aware, this book has not yet been published. Possibly the entry was made as an expectation of the author, which for some reason was not realized.

One of the limitations of the work is its uneven quality. The source of information for each entry was the person being treated. Some gave much more detailed information than others. Serving on the program committee of a literary society is probably a significant community service, but entering such minute activities greatly extends the length of one's entry. For this reason some important church leaders have much less space than do some rather minor community leaders. A reference work should be objective and relatively uniform in the kind and amount of information given. There seems to be here, however, a good deal of subjective evaluation. It would seem that the editorial blue pencil could have been more freely used.

Another detail that seems rather subjective and vague is the matter of church membership. Although primarily a listing of Mennonites, this work includes some people of Mennonite background now affiliated with other churches, but who, say the editors, "are still in sympathy with Mennonite principles." That is obviously a rather vague and subjective judgment. Again and again throughout the work men, chiefly professional men, are listed as belonging to one or the other of various Mennonite branches with the additional infomation, "now affiliated with the ——— church." Church membership becomes a rather elusive thing when one is a member of one church and affiliated with another. This would seem to involve fundamental contradictions when the subject is an important ecclesiastical official in another church. Is there such a thing as overlapping church membership? A few men who are obviously ex-Mennonites are listed as members of the Amish Mennonite Church when the reference is clearly to neither of the two bodies which can officially be called Amish Mennonite today. There should be no anachronisms in a work of reference. It would seem to be more accurate, as was done in a few cases, to give the present church membership with the addition, "formerly ——— Mennonite."

An interesting section of the book which one wishes could be extended is a series of pictures of Mennonite institutions. The classified directory of Mennonite business firms is so obviously incomplete as to be of limited value. A careful checking with the entries in the main section would have added some names to this directory. Valuable also are the lists of Mennonite mission stations, periodicals, and schools.

In spite of its limitations, this work is a panorama of Mennonite life unequaled in our literature. It is worth a day's browsing and frequent reference thereafter.

Goshen College Paul Erb.

Building the Canadian West. By JAMES B. HEDGES. New York: The MacMillan Company. 1939. Pp. 422. $4.00.

"Building the Canadian West" is the title of a well-written 410-page book telling the story of the Canadian Pacific Railway's colonization program from its beginning to the present. The author is professor of American history at Brown University. By the "Canadian West" the author means the provinces of Manitoba, Saskatchewan, and Alberta. It is in these prairie provinces that the most notable Canadian agricultural settlements took place during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. It is, also, in these provinces that practically all of the Mennonite immigrants from Russia settled in the two migrations in 1874-80 and 1923-1930. In this book the author pays considerable attention to the Mennonites and rather fully discusses their part in settling the Canadian West, especially as related to the C.P.R. Colonization Program. His treatment of the Mennonites is exceedingly fair, and one might say sympathetic.

The C.P.R. officials understood and appreciated the traditional devotion of the Mennonites to the community form of settlement and made every effort to satisfy these Mennonite preferences in their colonization policy. Hedges interestingly discusses the whole story of the C.P.R. officials' attempt to interest the Mennonites in Canada as well as the huge financial problem involved in helping them migrate and become established in agricultural communities. Regarding the significance of the Mennonites in the total colonization program, the author makes this comment regarding the most recent Mennonite immigratiion. "The movement of some twenty thousand Mennonites to Western Canada was, of course, the most spectacular feature and perhaps the most notable contribution of the Canadian Pacific to the increased settlement of the West during the post-war period. This achievement was rendered the more noteworthy by virtue of the fact that the company moved such a large portion of these people on a credit basis."

Mennonites cannot read this discussion without being profoundly grateful for the remarkable confidence the C.P.R. had in the integrity of the Mennonites. This story is especially valuable to Mennonite scholars who wish to discover the more intimate attitude of such an influential agency as the C.P.R. toward the Mennonites. Also, it provides a splendid opportunity to see Mennonites in the larger setting of a huge colonization program over half a century. About twenty-five pages are devoted to a discussion of the Mennonites and their place in the colonization of the C.P.R.

Bethel College J. Winfield Fretz.

INDEX

THE MENNONITE QUARTERLY REVIEW

Index to Volume XVIII, 1944

JANUARY

Editorial 4
Recent Mennonite Community Building in Canada
Winfield Fretz 5
Ernest von Wildenbruch's Drama, *Der Menonit*: An Historical and Literary Critique
Elizabeth Horsch Bender 22
Extinct Mennonite Churches in Ohio: I. The Church in Williams County
John Umble 36
Notes and Discussion
Was William Rittenhouse the First Mennonite Bishop in America: A Reappraisal
I. William Rittenhouse, First Mennonite Bishop in America, *Calvin Ira Kephart*
II. Was the Authorization of William Rittenhouse to Perform Baptisms Equivalent to Ordination as Bishop in the Mennonite Church: A Reply to Dr. Kephart, *Harold S. Bender.* 49
Book Reviews 59

APRIL

Editorial 66
The Anabaptist Vision
Harold S. Bender 67
Extinct Mennonite Churches in Ohio: II. The Church in Wood County
John Umble 89
Notes and Discussion
I. On Mennonite Historiography, and on Individualism and Brotherhood: *A Communication from Robert Friedmann*
II. On Mennonite Historiography: *A Communication in reply by C. H. Smith* 117

JULY

Editorial 130
Mennonites in the Civil War
Guy F. Hershberger 131
Bishop Christian Burkholder of Groffdale
Ira D. Landis 145
The Devotional Literature of the Mennonites in Danzig and East Prussia
Robert Friedmann 162
The Anabaptist Novelettes of Adolf Stern and Wilhelm Heinrich Riehl
Elizabeth Horsch Bender 174
Extinct Mennonite Churches in Ohio: III. The Church in Seneca County
John Umble 186

OCTOBER

Editorial 194
The Historiography of the Mennonites in the Netherlands
Cornelius Krahn 195
Extinct Mennonite Churches in Ohio: III. The Church in Seneca County (*concluded*); IV. The Church in Crawford and Richland Counties *John Umble* 225
Book Reviews 251